

The College of Wooster

Open Works

Senior Independent Study Theses

2022

Integrating Art History Into K-5 Social Studies Classrooms

Kate L. Schlegel

The College of Wooster, kschlegel22@wooster.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://openworks.wooster.edu/independentstudy>

Recommended Citation

Schlegel, Kate L., "Integrating Art History Into K-5 Social Studies Classrooms" (2022). *Senior Independent Study Theses*. Paper 9745.

This Senior Independent Study Thesis Exemplar is brought to you by Open Works, a service of The College of Wooster Libraries. It has been accepted for inclusion in Senior Independent Study Theses by an authorized administrator of Open Works. For more information, please contact openworks@wooster.edu.

© Copyright 2022 Kate L. Schlegel



Integrating Art History into K-5 Social Studies Classrooms

by

Kate Schlegel

Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements of Senior Independent Study

Supervised by
Dr. Tracy Cosgriff
Art History

Spring 2022

Abstract

This independent study investigates the possibility for interaction between art and history in elementary school curriculum. An analysis of current education initiatives at the federal level establishes the need to create a more effective history—or, its counterpart at the elementary level, social studies--curriculum. Since other subjects—such as English, math, and science—are assessed at the national level, while history is not, this subject is often under-emphasized in order to meet learning targets in these other subjects. A study of educational theorists, such as Piaget and William Blake, establishes the potential for the study of history with students at lower stages of cognitive development through the integration of art. Using this art implementation in the social studies classroom, a model is provided through the development of a unit and its defense, along with a discussion of existing curricula with relevant appeal. Finally, the opportunity for extension through field trips to art museums is explored through a discussion of the resources these institutions offer, such as our case study, the Frist. Though the integration of art history and social studies is not yet commonplace, this independent study seeks to exemplify the potential for increasing student outcomes in history that this practice offers.

Dedication

To the 8 year old who did not have the words to ask to study more history—may your students
never feel the same.

Acknowledgements

I would first like to thank my advisor, Professor Cosgriff, whose first class with me was cut short thanks to the pandemic. As the last Art History professor I had left to meet, I came into your class hoping you would recognize that I was extraordinary. What you taught me instead was that, in order to be extraordinary, you must constantly reinvent yourself. It is fitting, then, that our academic journey together ends on this note—in which you have seen the constant reinvention of some of my thoughts of most magnitude (and some of the least).

I would like to thank my mother, who I do not have enough words for. Mommy, thank you for watching my swim practices, for driving me to school, for always being at the bus stop, for figuring out my anxieties and fixing them before we even knew what they were. Thank you especially for understanding and holding down the fort when I could not think about anything but my I.S. Thank you for writing me a letter next to the dancing girl statue (which reminded me of GPS and therefore home) right before you dropped me off—now I go to that spot when I need to feel your presence. Finally, thank you for wishing and putting into words all that my college journey would be. I could not imagine that it would look like this, but you did, and I am eternally grateful. In the words of Taylor Swift, “And I love you for giving me your eyes / Staying back and watching me shine.”

Thank you to my grandfather, whose voracious hunger for knowledge is somewhat dulled in me, but hopefully still present. You may not have gotten to see any of my college journey, but I have tried to make you proud in every step of my college career and I think you would be over the moon with this experience.

Thank you to my grandmother, for sharing her name with me. Seeing your face as I told you about this project made me feel like a big deal. I hope that the picture of me turning this in stays on your bedside table for at least as long as my senior pictures (in black and white so you could not see my purple hair) have.

Thank you to Alice, whose constant curiosity and demands of the world bring out similar qualities in me. For you as well, my dear, I do not have enough words. Enjoy your last year, I’m here if you need me (and I assume you have already downloaded this document from OpenWorks, so I will live in your computer for always). Thank you to Mia, there will be a space the size of you wherever I end up next year. Thank you to Anne, for always being willing to be laughed at and for sending me resources for my kiddos, even when I did not ask for them.

Thank you to the swim team and Coach Rob, for giving me the opportunity for 2 hours every day to not think about I.S, even though sometimes it was excruciating (not the workout, not thinking about I.S.). Thank you especially to the swim team seniors who, instead of being hyper competitive and stressing me out in the way that only student-athletes can do, encouraged me in a way that made all this possible (#corefour). I hope that my work makes all of you proud (even if I am *just* an Art History major).

Thank you to the Art History Department for giving me amazing opportunities I could not even have imagined. Thank you Professor Morrow, for letting me do research for you and your ideas about tactile devotion. Thank you for letting me TA your Intro to Art History class—I had been looking forward to that opportunity since I took your class freshman year. I could not have been more honored to be asked. Thank you for giving me parts of your summer so I did not have to take a 9th semester. Thank you to Professor Siewert, who encouraged me to use my Junior I.S. to fill in gaps of my content knowledge (so that I knew that's **not** what I wanted to do for my Senior I.S.).

Thank you to the Education Department for being my emotional support since my first class in Morgan. They say that teaching is a social profession and I never truly believed I would fit in until suddenly, I **did**. Thank you especially to Professor Neptune for finding the time to meet and discuss my I.S. with me, coming to my Senior meet, and including me in your “plan.”

Thank you to my family. Kylie, for giving me the blueprint of what an Education major at an Ohio school would look like (even though I swore I would not pursue either). Brad, for truly showing me that success is defined individually and for being the smartest college dropout and the most curious person I know. Thank you to Asher, who provides me and our family with so much hope—without that hope and a vision for your future, I would have struggled even more with this project. And thank you to Amanda, for being better than me in every possible way. You are the true inspiration for this I.S. because when I think about what I want to pass on to my students, it is achieving more than what I, myself, am capable of (and you remind me of that every day).

Finally, I would like to thank my 5th graders, who remind me every day why I set out on this project in the first place. I hope that I can be as good of a teacher as you all seem to think I am.

Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>ii</i>
<i>Dedication</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>viii</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>1</i>
An Overview of Federal Frameworks	<i>2</i>
Theory and Methods	<i>4</i>
Overview of Chapters	<i>8</i>
<i>Chapter 1: Theory</i>	<i>12</i>
Introduction	<i>12</i>
Traditional Instructional Models.....	<i>13</i>
Art History as an Aid for Cognitive Development.....	<i>15</i>
<i>Art Historical Example- Michelangelo's David</i>	<i>18</i>
Art Education Theory.....	<i>22</i>
Art as an Aid for Historical Thinking	<i>25</i>
<i>Art Historical Example: Lukasa</i>	<i>26</i>
Scholarship on Children's Art Historical Understanding.....	<i>32</i>
Scholarship on Arts Integration in Social Studies.....	<i>35</i>
Conclusion.....	<i>38</i>
<i>Chapter 2: Implementation</i>	<i>40</i>
Introduction	<i>40</i>
Analysis of Existing Curricula	<i>41</i>
<i>Analysis of Art in Action</i>	<i>42</i>
<i>Analysis of Art in Story</i>	<i>45</i>
Creation of an Art Integration Curriculum.....	<i>47</i>
<i>Lesson 1</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>Lesson 2</i>	<i>52</i>
<i>Lesson 3</i>	<i>55</i>
Conclusion.....	<i>57</i>
<i>Chapter 3: Extension</i>	<i>58</i>
Introduction	<i>58</i>
Science-Based Field Trips.....	<i>59</i>
The National Council for Social Studies' Plans for a Field Trip	<i>62</i>

A Field Trip to the Frist.....	63
The Impact of Seeing Art in Person.....	72
Conclusion	74
Appendix A: Figures	78
Michelangelo. 1501-1504. David, frontal view. Place: Galleria dell'Accademia (Florence, Italy). https://library.artstor.org/asset/LESSING_ART_1039490336.	78
.....	79
Appendix B: Lesson Plans and Worksheets.....	81
<i>Figure 4: Lesson Plan for Lesson 1.....</i>	<i>81</i>
<i>Figure 6: Lesson Plan for Lesson 2.....</i>	<i>83</i>
<i>Figure 7: Lesson Plan for Lesson 3.....</i>	<i>85</i>
Bibliography.....	89

List of Figures

<i>Figure 1:David</i>	78
Figure 2: Lukasa (memory board)	79
Figure 3.Puppet theater in the Martin ArtQuest	80
Figure 4: Lesson Plan for Lesson 1	81
Figure 5. Worksheet for Lesson 1	83
Figure 6: Lesson Plan for Lesson 2	83
Figure 7: Lesson Plan for Lesson 3	85

Introduction

Social studies education, it seems to many educators, has never recovered from the blow dealt to it by the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) Act of 2001, with its high-stakes standardized testing in math and reading, to the detriment of other subjects.¹

This statement from 8th grade social studies teacher Samantha Stearns concisely summarizes the problem faced by educators today. In an elementary classroom—where one person is tasked with teaching students how to read, undertake mathematical calculations, think scientifically, and understand the world they live in—it is inevitable that one subject will not receive as much instructional time. Since students need to understand basic skills in order to put these skills together to study more complex phenomena, it makes even more sense that the subject that so often gets glossed over is incredibly complex—to the point where it is difficult as an adult to explain it. The complexity of this subject can be summarized through its name—social studies. Social studies combines history, geography, government, and economics and uses students' basic knowledge of English, math, and science to learn and make connections to the cultural frameworks around them. Social studies forms what will become the study of history in the upper grades; its complex interdisciplinary nature does not survive in the higher levels of the school system. As such a complex discipline based on the basic skills from English, math, and science, social studies is not tested in the elementary grades. While all other subjects are required to subject students to standardized testing under both the No Child Left Behind Act of 2001 and the Every Student Succeeds Act of 2015, there is no expectation under either of these laws that

¹ Samantha Stearns. "'What Changed' in Social Studies Education: A View from the Classroom." *Perspectives on History*. Summer 2019, published July 30, 2019. <https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/summer-2019/what-changed-in-social-studies-education>.

students ever be tested on social studies content.² At this point, it should be easy to see that there is at least a 14 year history of under-instructing social studies.³ In the post-NCLB era, how can we address this glaring ineffectiveness of instruction in social studies?

This thesis, combining art history and educational emphases, proposes arts integration as a strong pedagogical strategy for fostering experientially and critically important skill sets that have otherwise been lost in the desperate pursuit of reducing achievement gaps. By evaluating the potential for art to provide an anchor with which students can scaffold social studies learning surrounding concepts of time, space, society, and other curricular outcomes, this thesis seeks to revise the traditional instruction of social studies in American elementary schools. Revisions to social studies have the potential to develop in students a new global and cultural literacy that will be necessary for students' success as they leave school into the wider world of the 21st century.

An Overview of Federal Frameworks

Surrounding the complications of integrating art into social studies is the educational bureaucracy under which teachers must structure their lessons. While NCLB is no longer the prevailing educational law in the United States, its predecessor, the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) is another revision from the same prototype, Lyndon B. Johnson's Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965.⁴ NCLB was introduced under the Bush administration and received bipartisan support for its revolutionary approach to providing schools additional resources as incentives.⁵ Under the preceding educational policy, the Elementary and Secondary

²Gregory Korte. "The Every Student Succeeds Act vs. No Child Left Behind: What's changed?" *USA Today*, December 10, 2015. <https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/politics/2015/12/10/every-student-succeeds-act-vs-no-child-left-behind-whats-changed/77088780/>.

³ Korte, "NCLB vs. ESSA."

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Tom Loveless. "The Peculiar Politics of No Child Left Behind." Thesis, Brookings Institution, 2006. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/the-peculiar-politics-of-no-child-left-behind/>.

Education Act (ESEA), redistribution of federal funds for schools was enabled so that additional resources could be used by schools serving underprivileged populations, as needed.⁶ NCLB instead requires “local educators agree to produce certain outcomes” in order to receive federal funds.⁷ All three of these laws were meant to provide federal funding to states for schools in order “to ensure that every student [has] access to an education.”⁸ NCLB and ESSA determine states’ needs based on the results of standardized tests in English, math, and science. The testing schedule under ESSA is more flexible than that of NCLB, not requiring when tests should be taken or how they are administered, but maintains the grades and subjects in which students should be tested.⁹ For both of these laws, states are required to “test students on math and English every year in the third through eighth grades, and... once in high school” with “at least one science test in elementary, middle, and high school.”¹⁰ The response within schools to this requirement has been drastic. Data collected by The Council for Basic Education from elementary school principals found that “since the passage of NCLB, instructional time for tested subjects in 75 percent [of tested schools] had increased and instructional time for the arts had decreased.”¹¹ The current federal initiative surrounding education is the ESSA, which largely reiterates the annual standardized testing of NCLB, but moves “federal accountability to the States,” who will then turn in an accountability plan to the Education Department, while still allowing local educational agencies to seek additional grants.¹² While this model allows for more

⁶ Loveless, “Politics of No Child Left Behind.”

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Korte, “NCLB vs. ESSA.”

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Council for Basic Education. *Academic atrophy: The condition of the liberal arts in America’s public schools*. <http://downloads.ncss.org/legislative/AcademicAtrophy.pdf> (accessed June 27, 2008), quoted in Beveridge, Tina. “No Child Left Behind and Fine Arts Classes.” *Arts Education Policy Review* 111 (2010): 4-7.

¹² “Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA): A Comprehensive Guide.” Accessed February 27, 2022. <https://www.everystudentsucceedsact.org/>.

federal accountability for school success, as it identifies schools where students consistently underachieve based on a national average, it continues to dictate schools' curriculum. Since student performance is evaluated based on exams selected by the student's school's state government in order to get national funds, students need to be instructed based on the kinds of questions that will be on this test.¹³ Though students may be able to represent their knowledge in other ways within their classroom, if they do not know testing strategies—such as elimination, or that a question may have more than one answer on their standardized test—student success and, therefore school's success, will be lower than necessary to earn additional funds. Overall, current educational bureaucracy forces states to follow their testing schedule if these schools want to receive federal funding and stay afloat, which does not include any federally-mandated social studies assessment.

Theory and Methods

Because of the de-emphasis of social studies in classrooms, the literature surrounding student outcomes is also lacking. It is no longer a question of how *best* to teach social studies, but how to teach social studies *at all* in an arena in which only students' attainment of language, mathematical, and scientific skills are required to be tested by the federal level. It is up to individual teachers to scaffold social studies instruction, as they have time for it, and so the task of integrating art as an interdisciplinary study is daunting. Since there is not enough literature in educational theory surrounding how to integrate art into social studies, I have turned to art historical sources themselves as well as studies combining psychology and the scientific method into art historical subjects. For example, while students *have not* been assessed about how well they can contextualize history with its art based on style, they *have* been assessed on aesthetic

¹³ Korte, "NCLB vs. ESSA."

considerations of art leading toward an art historical understanding. The ability of students to form opinions on these aesthetic considerations has then been used by curious educators to investigate if art can be used as a tool to scaffold historical knowledge. With this conclusion, it is clear that students are able to make sense of art as historical evidence and what remains is to create the scaffolding with which classrooms can make meaningful connections between art and social studies. While educational resources do not abound surrounding the instruction of social studies using art, there are many different sources with conclusions obliquely related to these concerns throughout art historical, psychological, and scientific literature.

The educational theory that most supports the integration of art into general education classrooms is constructivism, in which students build their own networks of knowledge through direct experience.¹⁴ While this theory is overwhelmingly being integrated into classrooms at this time, to the point that this is one of the theories highlighted by Ohio's state educator certification exam, it is largely done so discreetly by subject.¹⁵ Supporting the constructivist model is the only model to trace cognitive development from birth to adolescence, Piaget's theory of cognitive development.¹⁶ This model divides childhood into four distinct stages in which students become progressively more independent and less reliant on concrete experiences to scaffold knowledge.¹⁷ Piaget's theory is especially relevant to students' attainment of written language, as they match the skill with which they have experience, speech, to the abstract symbols meant to represent it. By combining Piaget's theory and social art history, concrete art objects can be used by young students to scaffold chronology.

¹⁴ Kamii, Constance and Janice K. Ewing. "Basing Teaching on Piaget's Constructivism." *Childhood Education* 72, vol. 5 (1996): 260.

¹⁵ "Become a Teacher in Ohio." Accessed March 3, 2022. <https://teach.com/careers/become-a-teacher/teaching-credential/state-requirements/ohio/>.

¹⁶ Kamii and Ewing. "Piaget's Constructivism," 260-261.

¹⁷ Ibid.

The theoretical view of art history that this study takes is largely a social art history. In order to help students who cannot yet reliably use either expressive or receptive written language, art provides an object of interest as well as a testament to historical events and attitudes. As explained by Oxford Art Online, this view of art history supports “the premise that art is not autonomous but is inextricably linked to such social factors as morality, governed by laws, trade and technology, as well as politics, religion, and philosophy.”¹⁸ Therefore, studying the changes in art style and aesthetic reveals further details about culture and historical circumstances.¹⁹ The view that art objects can come to serve as representatives of their creating culture, supported by the theory of social art history, supports the use of art as an inroad to studying history in the primary grades.

Seizing on the opportunity for using social art history to study history in the primary grades, a new educational movement called arts integration forms a platform for this study. Though it is still a new initiative in educational circles, it builds off and expands the traditional instruction of art. The traditional instruction of art, called art education, relies heavily on art making and studio experiences.²⁰ While these experiences are incredibly enriching to students, by combining these artistic emphases with core content, students can reach deeper levels of understanding of both this core content as well as art. The combination of art and core content is called arts integration.²¹ Since the instruction of both art and social studies was deemphasized by achievement standards in both the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) initiative of 2001 and the

¹⁸ Aulinger, B. “Social History of Art.” *Grove Art Online*. 2003; accessed, 4 Mar. 2022. <https://doi.org/10.1093/gao/9781884446054.article.T079457>.

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Wan, Yinmei, Meredith Ludwig, Andrea Boyle, and Jim Lindsay. “The Role of Arts Integration and Education in Improving Student Outcomes.” *Fostering Arts Rich Schools* 20, no. 1 (2020): 37.

²¹ Ibid.

Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) of 2015, arts integration would have the most impact when the core content being combined with art is social studies-based.

Though scholarship surrounding arts integration is in its infancy, there are lots of studies surrounding how children respond both to art and history. The first theorist discussed in this thesis, aside from Piaget, is Parsons, who studied how children develop aesthetic taste based on their responses for 6 factors: Semblance, Subject Matter, Feelings, Color, Artist's Properties, Judgment, which will be discussed in Chapter 1.²² Though the development of aesthetic taste is not necessary for the study of art as history, Parson's aesthetic stages establish a platform on which subsequent researchers will assess the possibility for children to make art historical judgments. After a discussion of Parsons and how children respond to art, Chapter 1 turns to how children respond to history. Two groups of scholars are considered here. William Blake defined what skills are necessary for what we call "historical thinking," which involves making empathetic judgments about the past.²³ Blake then experimented to determine whether a curriculum based around primary or secondary sources most encouraged the development of these historical thinking skills²⁴. The second group of scholars—Moore, Alouf, and Needham—who investigated how children respond to history also engaged with curriculum, but rather than create and compare two curricula, they dissected established curricula.²⁵ What they found was that an effective curriculum engages both skill-based and content-based instructional activities.²⁶ One theorist who has engaged with art history in children's education is Mary Erickson, who

²²Parsons, Michael, Marilyn Johnston, and Robert Durham. "Developmental Stages in Children's Aesthetic Responses." *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 12, vol. 1 (1978): 83-104.

²³Blake, David W. 1981. "Observing Children Learning History." *The History Teacher* 14, no. 4 (August 1981): 533-549.

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵Moore, Jerry R., James L. Alouf, and Janie Needham. "Cognitive Development and Historical Reasoning in Social Studies Curriculum." *Theory and Research in Social Education* 12, vol. 2 (1984): 49-64.

²⁶ Ibid.

used Parson's stages of aesthetic development to assess if children will understand both the artistic and cultural implications of art.²⁷ Finally, Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub investigated how social studies educators currently used art in their classrooms, in pursuit of assessing the potential for arts integration in schools.²⁸ The input provided from these scholars about students' development of style (Parson), historical thinking (Blake), and ability to combine the two (Erickson) combined with the requirements of a curriculum engaging history (Moore, Alouf, and Needham) and the current potential for arts integration in schools (Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub) will be integrated as I design my own arts integration curriculum in Chapter 2.

Overview of Chapters

In Chapter 1, the reader will find a consideration of students' cognitive development in relation to art and history. This section first considers the ability of students to understand the wider context of history through an understanding of students' cognitive development. Through a look into the cultural understanding of Michelangelo's *David*, this section provides context for how students can be expected to use art as a representation and explanation of historical contexts. Then there is a comparison of arts integration and art education instruction to situate how teachers can best prepare their students for success in core subjects through interdisciplinary study. The focus on art then shifts to a focus on what historical thinking skills students need to be successful in social studies, guided by two approaches to best practice history instruction. Using these two approaches proving the benefit of using primary sources and the importance of teaching historical thinking methods alongside historical content, this chapter proves the place

²⁷ Erickson, Mary. "Chapter 13: Art Historical Understanding in Early Childhood." in *The Visual Arts and Early Childhood Learning*, ed. Christine Marmé Thompson (Reston, VA: National Art Education Association, 1995): 63-66.

²⁸ Taylor, Julie Anne, Timothy Monck, and Sanaa Ayoub. "Arts Integration in the Social Studies: Research and Perspectives from the Field." *The Councilor* 75, vol. 1 (2014): 23-48.

art can take in social studies classrooms following the best practice instruction of history.²⁹ What follows is a discovery using students' established cognitive development skills in relation to art and aesthetic considerations to explore the possibility of students' understanding of art history.³⁰ Then comes a discussion of current arts integration efforts in the field through a survey administered to current educators targeting the way they use art in their classrooms.³¹ Through this study, the resources teachers need and the current state of arts integration in social studies is identifiable. Chapter 1 covers the theoretical support behind integrating art objects to scaffold the adoption of historical thinking methods, which is necessary to create an arts integration curriculum, of which there are no current outstanding models.

The theory in Chapter 1 is put into practice in Chapter 2 through a discussion of the existing art education curricula and the creation of a series of lesson plans. By analyzing existing curricula from *Art in Action* and *Art in Story*, I will identify the shortcomings of existing curricula. Largely, these shortcomings are linked to increased emphasis on art making in curriculum involving art, rather than a heavy emphasis on the corresponding social studies content. In response to these identified shortcomings, what follows is a small social studies unit based around art, but integrating strong social studies standards, to model how teachers can develop art integration resources. After considering these curricula and what elements are useful, it is vital to consider the frameworks teachers are required to use to create their lessons; namely, state standards. After exploring these state standards, I selected a relevant grade level and standard strand to illustrate what an arts integration lesson should accomplish: integrating both historical thinking skills as well as historical, or art historical, content. The first lesson follows

²⁹ Blake, "Observing Children," 533-549. And Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49-64.

³⁰ Erickson, "Art Historical Understanding," 63-66.

³¹ Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 23-48.

the curricular models of Chapter 1, integrating historical thinking skills about mapping before introducing the content or art. This unit has been based around 2nd grade standards to demonstrate that teachers can integrate art even with some of the youngest students and still find success in social studies achievement. The second lesson introduces art and social studies content to give students concrete practice with the historical thinking skills from lesson one. The final lesson is scaffolded from the curricula discussed earlier in the chapter, showing how educators can use existing resources, but strengthen them through the introduction of additional social studies content. This thesis moves from the theoretical support of students' ability to understand social studies content at grades earlier than traditionally taught in Chapter 1. Chapter 2 introduces existing instructional methods surrounding arts integration, or using art to teach social studies. While the development and implementation of lessons within the classroom is an important element of education, it is the employment of this knowledge that ultimately realizes the goals of education.

An important extraneous element of elementary school, a miniature model of how students will engage their knowledge in their real world, is considered in Chapter 3. This extension piece comes from the traditional, American field trip. Field trips connect students to direct experiences that aid in their construction of knowledge, as supported by Piaget's cognitive development theory from Chapter 1. Through direct experiences with art in the museum setting during a field trip, students create a network of the concrete expression of the passage of time. This consideration of field trips begins with the results observed through science-based field trips, since very little data exists surrounding field trips based around social studies. The resources provided by the Frist Art Museum in Nashville, Tennessee form the backbone of this discussion of field trips, as I have personal experience both developing and utilizing these

resources. Finally, the benefits of field trips to art museums in comparison to similar virtual experiences is weighed and analyzed through the lens of constructivist educational policies. The final step of this thesis moves from practice to extension through a consideration of the field trip's role in an elementary school child's education.

Chapter 1: Theory

Introduction

The era of No Child Left Behind (NCLB) of 2002 brought to American public schools a new attitude toward education. One of the provisions of NCLB was including the arts as a core academic subject in public elementary schools. Along with “English, reading or language arts, math, science, history, civics and government, geography, economics, ... and foreign language,” teachers of the arts were required to meet their state’s definition of a highly qualified teacher.³² This law required candidates to “[demonstrate] knowledge in their subject area” through “passing a rigorous subject test in each of the academic he or she teaches.”³³ In Ohio, the state in which I have the most experience teaching, that entails passing a test, the Ohio Assessment for Educators (OAE).³⁴ By adding art to core academic subjects, NCLB signaled a commitment to excellence in teaching the arts. However, this was not the core goal of NCLB and I would argue that this initiative has done the opposite for many of the core academic subjects in elementary schools. The core legislation of NCLB was meant to bring into public academics a stronger focus on more measurable reading and math skills, leading to the loss of instructional time for other subjects taught in the elementary general education classroom.³⁵ As a result, any resurgence in arts instruction under NCLB does not allot to the arts enough resources to generate new teaching methods. Traditional methods of teaching art at the elementary level are understood in terms of art making, missing the key quality of art as expressive language for young children, and

³² U.S. Department of Education, Office of the Deputy Secretary. *No Child Left Behind: A Toolkit for Teachers*, Washington, D.C., 2004. p. 10.

³³ Ibid., p. 21

³⁴ “Become a Teacher in Ohio.”

³⁵ Stearns, “What Changed.”

focusing instead on technical skill. In order to secure federal funding, which keeps public schools open, these schools had to implement a more reading-focused curriculum, creating a loss of instructional time for other disciplines, such as art and social studies.³⁶ By using Piaget's theory to combine the study of art into social studies—using art as symbols, or concrete objects aiding in the development of abstract concepts of time—schools can renew their focus on both social studies and art while creating a more quality learning experience for students.

I argue that, contrary to traditional knowledge, the introduction of a more rigorous social studies curriculum is possible in even the youngest grades. This rigorous curriculum can be made developmentally appropriate through an integration of art objects to the social studies. This challenges current academic initiatives, such as NCLB and the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), but will provide stronger scaffolding for visual literacy, cultural empathy, and global perspective, generating greater student success in the humanities.

Traditional Instructional Models

The study of art has two different established instruction methods. The traditional instructional method is art education, in which students obtain a hands-on, technique-driven studio education. Simultaneously, students are learning about artists and history to mimic their techniques in the pursuit of creating art. The second, newer focus of studying art is called arts integration, in which the arts are studied alongside other disciplines. For example, art can be used to study math using the Golden Spiral in art. This visual study then provides students with the vocabulary to describe mathematical concepts having to do with logarithms, which provide even more background into the art. Through the interchange of these two disciplines, the art classroom and subjects covered in the general education classroom are in discussion rather than separated.

³⁶ Stearns, "What Changed."; Korte, "NCLB vs. ESSA."

Schools could enhance students' time in both the art classroom and general education classroom by moving towards an arts integration curriculum, because studying the arts promotes interdisciplinary connections involving content that will reach more students.

As an art historian investigating arts integration, one general education classroom subject seems to lend itself particularly well to the practice—social studies. Social studies is particularly related to arts integration because of the established study of art history. For the purposes of this study, art history is “the ability to interpret art works in their own historical-cultural contexts.”³⁷ By connecting art and what we call social studies—which in Ohio includes history, geography, government, and economics—we introduce students to a form of art history.³⁸ Students may be particularly interested in studying art history because of the increased engagement which students get through interaction with art objects. This phenomenon has been intensely studied and, indeed, even virtual experiences with concrete art objects is not as acutely interesting as studying them in person.³⁹ Additionally, art and symbols have a unique relevance to children's cognitive development, which will be discussed later in this paper. Teaching art history in the elementary classroom creates a wider and deeper cultural literacy, improves student engagement and comprehension, and promotes student empathy—all useful skills that contribute to desired results, such as meaningful field trips to local cultural institutions, such as art museums.

³⁷ A definition that originates from Mary Erickson, who undertook research on the ability of lower elementary students (grades K-3) to understand historical context through art. Erickson, “Art Historical Understanding.” 64.

³⁸ Ohio Department of Education. “Ohio's Learning Standards for Social Studies.” Adopted Jan. 2019, last modified Jan. 1, 2022. <https://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Ohio-s-Learning-Standards-for-Social-Studies/SSFfinalStandards01019.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US>.

³⁹ Brieber, David, Marcos Nadal, and Helmut Leder. “In the White Cube: Museum Context Enhances the Valuation and Memory of Art.” *Acta Psychologica* 154 (2015): 36-42.

Art History as an Aid for Cognitive Development

Public elementary schools largely base the progression of their curriculum around children's cognitive development. The Ohio Assessment for Educators (OAE), a test that gives teachers certification to teach in Ohio, places developmental psychology on its exam.⁴⁰ A key developmental theory, since it describes the acquisition of representational thought through the process of equilibration, together with how children acquire "social knowledge and physical maturation," is Jean Piaget's theory of cognitive development.⁴¹ This theory has been built on to develop many curricular models and underlies many of the studies surrounding children learning history that will be discussed in this paper. However, there is still some argument in the literature about the coordination of Piaget's cognitive development stages with the attainment of historical thinking skills. Added to this complication is the fact that "much of [teaching] remains at a stage of folk art based on opinions and trial-and-error."⁴² This means that students' "inability to understand history may *not* be an artifact of developmentalism but rather an indication of poor teaching methods in history."⁴³ By creating stronger methods of instructing students in history and social studies, such as integrating art into this study, we can learn more about the appropriateness of teaching history for the development of young students. Following the constructivist model of cognitive development, I will seek to find theoretical support for using art as a concrete experience to anchor students' understanding of historical concepts in the following pages.

⁴⁰ "Become a Teacher in Ohio."

⁴¹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 59.

⁴² Kamii and Ewing, "Piaget's Constructivism," 264.

⁴³ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 59.

Since much of the literature surrounding the historical learning process in early childhood is based on Piagetian constructivism, it is necessary to understand the key concepts of this cognitive developmental theory. Jean Piaget was a French biologist interested in understanding the nature of knowledge through its formation in children.⁴⁴ Piaget's theory forms the basis of constructivism, an instructional philosophy in which children are responsible for creating their own systems of understanding.⁴⁵ Piaget theorized that students encountered a feeling of "disequilibrium" when encountering an unknown.⁴⁶ In order to create systems of understanding, at this point children can either assimilate (categorize new experiences with prior knowledge) or accommodate (create a new category of knowledge because the new experience is not explained by prior knowledge) the new stimulus.⁴⁷ As children create larger networks of connections, they progress from concrete to abstract thought, moving through four distinct developmental stages.⁴⁸ Building on Piaget's cognitive development theory, I speculate that art can be used as a concrete example of history as an aid to scaffold students' understanding of the abstract concept of time, allowing for instruction involving historical thinking to take place earlier in elementary school classrooms than was thought developmentally appropriate.

To determine if arts integration makes teaching history at younger grades appropriate, we must analyze students' cognitive development at this age. In order to do so, I will be using Piaget's theory of cognitive development, since it is included on the Ohio Assessment for Educators (OAE) and is therefore acknowledged as meaningful by the state in which I am

⁴⁴ Kamii and Ewing, "Basing Teaching on Piaget," 260.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 54.

⁴⁷ Ibid., 54-55.

⁴⁸ Ibid., 54.

conducting my study.⁴⁹ The stages of Piaget's theory are scaffolded by a child's reliance on concrete objects to represent abstract ideas.⁵⁰ For example, when learning written language, Piaget's theory shows that "symbolic images link memory and meaning with representational language," or that objects and symbols serve as the scaffolding for representational language.⁵¹ According to Piaget's theory, children in elementary school are generally in the second to fourth stages of cognitive development.⁵² The most common level of cognitive development at which students will enter elementary school is the concrete operational stage, in which children begin to develop mental representations of things not currently in front of them.⁵³ This is the ideal time to introduce children to school, since these mental images will evolve into thought with instruction.⁵⁴ Even children in the preoperational stage would benefit from using art to study history, since they are beginning to "develop mental representations of (images) of events and objects removed from their presence."⁵⁵ These children can understand more complex ideas and themes based on the portrayal of these ideas in the concrete, visual forms of an artistic composition. As children progress into the concrete operational stage, around age 6 or 7, they rely less on concrete objects as symbolic representations of thoughts.⁵⁶ Children in the formal operational stage, around twelve, adopt the ability to solve problems dealing with experiences they may not relate to, meaning that they are perfectly primed to understand historical content, which is consistent with current teaching practices.⁵⁷ However, children at stages before the

⁴⁹ "Become a Teacher in Ohio."

⁵⁰ Blake, "Observing Children," 534.

⁵¹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 55.

⁵² Ibid., 54-55.

⁵³ Ibid., 55.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid., 53, 56.

formal operational stage have the capacity to use art as a symbol for history, allowing elementary schools to scaffold historical thinking skills earlier in elementary school. In doing so, schools can better prepare children for a deeper understanding of history and empathy. Using art as a symbol for history allows teachers to scaffold historical thinking skills throughout elementary school. This early introduction and scaffolding prepare children for deeper understandings of history and empathy as they move up through the grades. Since the Ohio Department of Education lends credence to Piaget's theory by including it on the exam to ensure quality teachers, moving from image to abstract idea in schools should be highly scaffolded in every content area. For both social studies and art, this scaffolding can take the shape of interdisciplinary study to give abstract historical themes concrete examples.

The examples used to show the way that children move from concrete to abstract thought through Piaget's model are largely linguistic. Consequently, these cognitive developmental milestones are used to support the acquisition of written language through symbolic play.⁵⁸ However, I argue that the potential for this theory extends into social studies because of the connection between art and history, as exemplified at the college and post-graduate level. Through looking at the following example, we can see how Piaget's theory applies to the potential of students to understand and distinguish between specific historical periods, create a concept of episodic linear time, and increase their cultural literacy.

Art Historical Example- Michelangelo's David

Piaget's principle of cognitive development suggests that students need a concrete example to scaffold abstract thought. Per the implications of Piaget's cognitive development theory and through the lens of social art history, visual art can be used as a concrete

⁵⁸ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 55-56.

representation of culture, which is the focus of social studies among elementary school students. For example, Michelangelo's *David* (Figure 1) is synonymous with Italy and the Renaissance and serves as a recognizable historical and geographic symbol. Study of its manufacture and context helps elucidate key cultural and curricular themes. Carved between 1501 and 1504, *David* was part of a string of commissions by the new republic in Florence, a move that John Paoletti and Gary Radke argue does two things:

[The commissions] provided the physical site of government with a powerful new series of images designed to establish an iconography of restored republican power and they evoked the history of the earlier republican city, both in their iconography and in their placement.⁵⁹

In other words, in its own time, *David* was used to signal a change in Florentine government both through its newness and its relationship to earlier systems of representation coming from the earlier republican government of the city. Moreover, by portraying the Old Testament hero David in the nude, Michelangelo referenced a hero type founded in the ancient Greek style.⁶⁰ The *David* was meant to be placed in the Florentine cathedral, which meant that the sculpture simultaneously fit in with earlier art in the cathedral, undertaken during the golden age of the Florentine Republic from nearly a century before; was accessible to all Florentines; and demonstrated the new power of the republican government.⁶¹ But in coming to look at *David* through a historical lens, we must ask: how does the sculpture come to speak as a learning tool?

Michelangelo's *David* is an artifact of early Italian and historical memory. For its contemporary viewers, the *David* demonstrated simultaneously a change in power in Florence

⁵⁹ Paoletti, John T. and Gary M. Radke. *Art in Renaissance Italy*. (New York: H.N. Abrams, 1997): 2nd edition. 348.

⁶⁰ Barkan, Leonard. *Unearthing the Past: Archaeology and Aesthetics in the Making of Renaissance Culture*. (New Haven [Conn.]: Yale University Press, 1999), 255.

⁶¹ Paoletti and Radke, *Art in Renaissance Italy*. 348-349.

and the continuation of Florentine identity.⁶² Commissioned by the new republic in Florence, ruled by the Signoria, after the exile of the Medici, the sculpture is clearly a reference to the glories of the past—those of Florence itself and the ancient, classical world.⁶³ Traditionally, the *David* has been understood as a result of the relationship between ancient Greek statuary and the popularity of the study of ancient Greece and Rome during the Renaissance.⁶⁴ In support of this interpretation, Leonard Barkan argues that Michelangelo's *David* begins the re-emergence of Polykleitan contrapposto that will be “replicated in a number of [the Renaissance's] greatest artistic works.”⁶⁵ However, classical humanism is only part of the explanation for the appearance of Michelangelo's *David*. In order to redefine Florentine identity, the Signoria chose to depict the Old Testament hero David. Following the exile of Medici, Donatello's bronze *David* was seized by the Signoria and re-installed in front of the Palazzo della Signoria, signaling the change in power from elite families to a government more accessible to the people.⁶⁶ However, this move was not enough and so the Signoria chose to commission a statue of David, as the Medici had, for public consumption in the cathedral.⁶⁷ Michelangelo, as Donatello had, chose to depict David in the nude, therefore referencing both the Classical and recent past.⁶⁸ Finally, the *David* echoes the new Florentine identity through its accessibility and form. Meant for display in the cathedral, the Signoria's *David* would have been highly visible and accessible to all Florentines.⁶⁹

Michelangelo's *David* changes canonical depictions of the Old Testament hero through “the

⁶² Paoletti and Radke, *Art in Renaissance Italy*. 348-349.

⁶³ Ibid., 348.

⁶⁴ Barkan, *Unearthing the Past*, 255.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁶ Paoletti and Radke, *Art in Renaissance Italy*. 348.

⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Ibid.

suggestion that the ordinary can be transformed into the extraordinary by a decisive moment of action.”⁷⁰ David is depicted either before or after the stone which kills his gigantic opponent is thrown. This change in the canon of depiction of David demonstrates a change in the identity of Florence—though the city, and the hero, continue to draw from traditions of the past.

In this way, Michelangelo’s sculpture illustrates Florentine identity and its ties to the Classical past that define Italy in the Renaissance. As Paoletti and Radke argue, “the colossal size of the figure ... implies a link with colossal sculptures of antiquity; the greatness of Greece and Rome is now equalled (spelled wrong?) by that of Florence.”⁷¹ In other words, the sculpture illuminates key ideas and themes about the past. These systems of meaning, portrayed through artistic form, provide students and scholars the symbols with which cultures understand themselves and each other.⁷² In this way, art becomes the symbol in Piagetian theory that will scaffold the content-heavy abstract thought characterizing the study of history through events in the upper grades.

Through the example of Michelangelo’s *David*, it is clear to see how art represents narratives of the past. Art’s unique ability to garner empathy from viewers throughout time and space make it particularly pertinent to the study of history. Symbols, such as the subject of the Biblical hero David, come to serve as expressive language not only at the personal level, but also throughout whole communities and cultures. Through understanding these visual symbols, students can access a deeper understanding of these communities of the past. Traditionally, concepts of time and the study of history are not introduced to children until they are in, roughly,

⁷⁰Paoletti and Radke, *Art in Renaissance Italy*, 349.

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² Ibid.

4th grade.⁷³ Before this, students study “social studies,” an amalgamation of history, geography, government, and economics related to the communities around them, as students at early levels are still relating concepts learned at school to their own experiences, and growing to a global understanding.⁷⁴ Relying on Piaget’s theory of cognitive development and recent studies into the adaptability of art into traditional classroom topics, art is particularly pertinent to the social studies classroom. As a concrete representation of symbols that help us to understand communities of the past, art can be used to help students adopt concepts of time earlier than thought possible, while remaining appropriate for children’s development as established in Piaget’s theory of cognitive development.

Art Education Theory

Despite the ability of the arts to represent historical concepts in age-appropriate ways, the arts have traditionally been taught stand-alone, with art **making** as the ultimate goal. This began in the pre-war era, when the ability to draw would prepare children for eventual industrial careers.⁷⁵ This attitude changed with the Progressive Education movement of the early 20th century, to an approach that integrated more study of artistic masterpieces.⁷⁶ By the 1960s, Winsand observed that “many art educators believed the only way to appreciate art was to participate in it.”⁷⁷ I would argue that this attitude continues to characterize elementary studies of

⁷³ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, “Cognitive Development,” 53.

⁷⁴ Ohio Department of Education. “Ohio’s Learning Standards for Social Studies.” Adopted Jan. 2019, last modified Jan. 1, 2022. <https://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Ohio-s-Learning-Standards-for-Social-Studies/SSFfinalStandards01019.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US>.

⁷⁵ Seaboldt, Betty Oliver. “Defining Art Appreciation.” *Art Education* (Reston, VA.) 54, no. 4 (2001): 45.

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ Winsand, O.M. “Art Appreciation in the public schools from 1930 to 1960. Dissertation Abstracts International. 22, no. 6 (1961) quoted in Seaboldt, “Defining Art Appreciation,” 45.

art, as art classes under NCLB support a model of instruction in which art classes are treated as “electives,” and schools may replace this class with a “remedial math or reading class” should students fail the state test.⁷⁸ Instruction within these elective classes for art follows the tradition of art education, which consists largely of time spent in technical practice during in-studio instruction. It focuses on art for art’s sake and largely takes place in separate art classes.

However, as proposed by the interdisciplinary focus of arts integration, the arts have the potential to deepen students’ understanding in the core concept areas taught within elementary school classrooms—English language arts, science, math, and social studies.⁷⁹ This comes from the ability of art to be flexible in vocabulary and engagement. Students across demographics, abilities, and interests can respond to art and therefore improve upon their educational experience in diverse ways. In the social studies classroom specifically, arts integration reveals the unique opportunity to assist in children’s development of historical thinking skills while meeting them where they are on the spectrum of cognitive development.

In order to expand current research into interdisciplinary studies involving the arts, it is important to understand how the interaction between children and the arts has been studied in the past. Scholarship on children’s enrichment from art in educational settings is largely based on enjoyment and connoisseurship.⁸⁰ Scholarship studying these aspects of the interaction between children and art follows traditional art education and closes off the discipline from other subjects. However, as has been shown through the example of *David* as an artistic representation of Renaissance Italy, art can represent themes and help students understand time. A key theorist

⁷⁸ Beveridge, Tina. “No Child Left Behind and Fine Arts Classes.” *Arts Education Policy Review* 111 (2010): 5.

⁷⁹ Taylor, Julie Anne, Timothy Monck, and Sanaa Ayoub. “Arts Integration in the Social Studies: Research and Perspectives from the Field.” *The Councilor* 75, vol. 1 (2014): 23.

⁸⁰ Seaboldt, “Defining Art Appreciation.” 44-45.

studying children's responses to the arts is Michael Parsons, an associate professor at the University of Utah. Parsons' stages of aesthetic response, published in 1978, were created in response to children's interest in art.⁸¹ Parsons looked to identify how children develop aesthetic taste in distinct stages reflecting their cognitive development.⁸² Parsons identified these stages through showing individual students from grades one through 12 "three large reproductions of well-known paintings" and asking them questions related to six topics.⁸³ Parsons essentially identified three stages for four of the topics covered in his study. These topics were Semblance ("what makes it a picture?")⁸⁴, Subject Matter⁸⁵, Feelings ("what kinds and sources of emotions are influential in the aesthetic response?")⁸⁶, and Color.⁸⁷ For the last two topics, Artist's Properties ("what it takes to be a good artist")⁸⁸ and Judgment ("anything ... counted as a reason for claiming 'this is a good painting.'")⁸⁹, Parsons and his team found four distinct stages. These stages of aesthetic appreciation fall roughly in line with cognitive developmental stages from Piaget based on age, with 1st-4th grades on the lowest level of development, 5th-8th in the middle, and 9th-12th reaching the highest levels of developmental achievement.⁹⁰ Michael Parsons' designations of stages within the development of aesthetic response allowed for other scholars to observe how students use art to scaffold their understanding of other subjects.

⁸¹ Parsons, Michael, Marilyn Johnston, and Robert Durham. "Developmental Stages in Children's Aesthetic Responses." *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 12, vol. 1 (1978): 83.

⁸² Parsons, Johnston, and Durham, "Children's Aesthetic Responses, 83.

⁸³ Ibid., 85.

⁸⁴ Ibid., 87-90.

⁸⁵ Ibid., 90-92.

⁸⁶ Ibid., 92-94.

⁸⁷ Ibid., 95-97.

⁸⁸ Ibid., 97-100.

⁸⁹ Ibid., 100-104.

⁹⁰ Parsons, Johnston, and Durham, "Children's Aesthetic Responses," 86.; Erickson, "Art Historical Understanding," 63-64.

Art as an Aid for Historical Thinking

While an understanding of students' response to art and what makes it "good" or "bad," as collected by Parsons, is required for art to be used to enrich a social studies classroom, a consideration of students' understanding of history is also necessary when considering arts integration in social studies classrooms. Specific cognitive skills necessary for studying history are outlined by educational theorist David W. Blake. Blake used the idea that teaching history is meant to aid students in acquiring an agreed-upon set of skills to examine children's response to historical experiences and therefore extrapolate implications for the teaching of history at the junior school level.⁹¹ In other words, Blake examined the variety of historical thinking skills students must develop in order to examine the practice of history instruction.⁹² Blake outlines the agreed-upon goals of history instruction, in which children should be expected to:

Examine and correlate facts ... to express the result in a clear form to think and argue logically—forming independent judgements supported by the evidence which is available—and to have a realization that a conclusion is simply a working hypothesis which may be modified in the light of new evidence.⁹³

The end goal of the study of history is for students to be able to analyze data and argue their understanding following the logic of available evidence.⁹⁴ In practice, the study of history is meant for students to create empathetic understandings of societies in the past, using data they find important to judge what makes these societies vital to an understanding of the present.⁹⁵ With the creation of individual student judgements of the past as the end goal, art may prove an invaluable early model to show young students the process of creating an historical argument and

⁹¹ Blake, "Observing Children," 533.

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ Ibid., 533-534.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

⁹⁵ Ibid., 534.

coming to a conclusion. Traditionally, historical data is transferred through written texts, either from textbooks or primary sources. However, these dense texts are not accessible to younger students. This has led to direct historical instruction beginning only after students have achieved reading mastery.⁹⁶ By incorporating art as historical evidence, students can be introduced to historical thinking skills as young as Piaget's concrete operational stage, when students cannot yet think or reveal their ideas abstractly in purely words. If the end goal of history instruction is to encourage students to make their own judgments, teachers should model that formula early, using art as an age-appropriate primary source.

Art Historical Example: Lukasa

A primary source which also functions as a model of the kinds of personal judgment required of higher-level historical thinking skills is the lukasa of the Luba Peoples of Africa (*figure 2*). This item is included as part of the curriculum of one of the highest-level history courses available to American students, Advanced Placement Art History.⁹⁷ In this way, it has been signaled as an important historical document. The lukasa is a palm-sized board decorated by an individual storyteller with three dimensional objects that can be traced, rubbed, or otherwise engaged using tactile senses to help a storyteller as they tell a story.⁹⁸ The individual elements of decoration on the surface of the lukasa and the board's use prove that art provides a concrete reference to historical narratives. Additionally, it demonstrates for students that not all facts need be used, but only those meaningful to the storyteller. This example stands out because it uses art as a mnemonic aid, in which meaning is simultaneously made and interpreted on a

⁹⁶ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 53.

⁹⁷ Moss, Juliet. "Lukasa (memory board) (Luba peoples)." Accessed March 9, 2022. <https://www.khanacademy.org/humanities/ap-art-history/africa-apah/central-africa-apah/a/lukasa-memory-board-luba-peoples>.

⁹⁸ Ibid.

personal level.⁹⁹ The lukasa models how students can reference art as concrete objects representing historical themes that they are learning. This object demonstrates the fundamental potential for art to serve as a concept map to guide students through geographic, cultural, and ideological facts through visual literacy. Additionally, this object demonstrates the power of art to aid students to cite and recall specific historical facts. As the Luba peoples have historically used art as a source of remembrance, art in the United States elementary classroom has the potential to be used as a reference for elementary school students to recall a specific progression of people or eras.¹⁰⁰ Additionally, it serves as a model for personal involvement in the sorting of historical evidence into logical arguments. Finally, as an object produced within the confines of a different cultural background, engaging with the lukasa in the classroom increases student cultural literacy and sensitivity. Through the example of the lukasa, teachers can model personal engagement with historical facts, techniques to build these facts into logical arguments, and cultural literacy within their social studies classrooms.

As Blake suggests, the goal of instruction in history is for students to create arguments to understand people and communities in the past, using selected evidence. In the lower elementary grades, these abstract ideas of community and time can be introduced into students' networks of understanding through art objects such as the lukasa. The understanding of community is the ultimate goal of elementary social studies education in Ohio.¹⁰¹ The theme of social studies for

⁹⁹ Moss, "Lukasa (memory board)."

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ Ohio Department of Education. "Ohio's Learning Standards for Social Studies." Adopted Jan. 2019, last modified Jan. 1, 2022. <https://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Ohio-s-Learning-Standards-for-Social-Studies/SSFfinalStandards01019.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US>.

Ohio's 3rd grade is quite explicitly "Communities: Past and Present, Near and Far."¹⁰² The standards go on to explain that:

The local community serves as the focal point for third grade as students begin to understand how their communities have changed over time and to make comparisons with communities in other places. The study of local history comes alive through the use of artifacts and documents. They also learn how communities are governed and how the local economy is organized.¹⁰³

By using art objects to convey the abstract ideas of community and the passage of time concretely, the goal of understanding these concepts can be attained earlier and students can continue to move through material, perhaps integrating different cultural examples. By using concrete art objects to understand concepts of time, schools provide scaffolding for higher-order historical thinking skills that will guide students to the goal of history instruction: forming their own judgments about the past.

Seeking to create a history curriculum which supported students as they created conclusions about the past based on evidence, Blake used his goal of history instruction to compare two methods of instruction.¹⁰⁴ Both of these methods used the same program of teacher-led instruction as an introduction to new subjects.¹⁰⁵ However, one of the methods was based on the study of primary sources during class time.¹⁰⁶ The other class used secondary sources, especially textbooks, in the same way as the primary sources.¹⁰⁷ Both of these methods were used on class of students aged 9-11.¹⁰⁸ Blake chose the Victorian era as his focus and assessed children in order to determine whether primary or secondary sources provided elementary

¹⁰² "Ohio's Social Studies," 9.

¹⁰³ Ibid.

¹⁰⁴ Blake, "Observing Children," p. 535.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid., 536.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid., 535.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid.

students with a deeper understanding of the past.¹⁰⁹ Blake used a variety of assessment methods, including Imaginative Writing samples, which required students to write a story set in Victorian times and was “deliberately left open-ended,” and a Concept Exercise identifying ten vocabulary terms relevant to the subject.¹¹⁰ Blake concluded that “work on historical documents gives children an understanding of the origin of information and it brings to them the real meaning of phrases in a textbook such as bad housing conditions or child labour.”¹¹¹ Blake’s conclusion, therefore, was that primary sources were the most effective way to reach his goal of helping students understand the past, though he did note that this approach should not be used to the exclusion of others.¹¹²

Blake’s conclusion establishes the effectiveness of using primary sources to teach history in elementary school to enrich and deepen students’ understanding of the past.¹¹³ While it is clear that pieces of art, such as Michelangelo’s *David* or the *lukasa*, can also function as primary sources, Blake’s study does not provide insight into the effectiveness of these resources. That is because Blake does not mention how much of his chosen primary sources were textual and how many were artistic, though he does include in his study a Picture Classification exercise in which students were asked to place pictures into groups as they saw fit.¹¹⁴ However, as previously established in my discussion of Piaget, symbols and therefore fine art are more accessible to children in the age range Blake was using for his study. I argue that art should be used as primary source material, especially in younger students who cannot yet understand dense text. While

¹⁰⁹ Blake, “Observing Children,” 535.

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 536, 538.

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, 547.

¹¹² *Ibid.*, 548.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 535-536, 539-545.

Blake's study establishes that using primary sources is a more effective way to teach history than using solely secondary sources, his study can be more meaningful and establish a foundation for historical thinking skills in even younger children using fine art as a primary source. This would create a richer environment for studying history and better scaffold the development of historical thinking in public elementary schools. Blake also notes that, in the final exercise of factual writing, "the two topics most extensively discussed by the documents group [...] and only summarily dealt with by the other group were working conditions, especially those affecting children."¹¹⁵ These results demonstrate that, not only did children gain a more effective understanding of the past through interaction with primary sources, but they also developed a greater empathy for historical times, achieving another goal of historical thinking as indicated by Blake. Blake's study proves that using primary sources, of which art can be considered, allows for more effective instruction of historical thinking skills to younger students.

Moore, Alouf, and Needham have created another historical thinking model analyzing how K-12 social studies curriculum can be structured around students' developmental characteristics, social studies knowledge, and practice using historical thinking skills.¹¹⁶ This model was created in pursuit of aiding decision-makers in local schools to design a K-12 social studies curriculum, so it will be useful in our consideration of integrating art and social studies.¹¹⁷ The authors argue that, when content analysis was undergone on social studies curricula, it yielded two types of instructional objectives.¹¹⁸ What the authors term the "methodological concept cluster" lays out the methods or skills necessary for making meaning

¹¹⁵ Blake, "Observing Children," 545.

¹¹⁶ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49.

¹¹⁷ Ibid.

¹¹⁸ Ibid., 51-52.

out of social studies, or what students will do to analyze history.¹¹⁹ We can think of these methods as Blake's historical thinking skills. In contrast, what authors call the "substantive concept cluster" includes the content that students make meaning from.¹²⁰ Moore, Alouf, and Needham argue that "it is the union of method and substantive concepts that permits students to develop generalizations that give meaning to social studies and hopefully their social world."¹²¹ In other words, without teaching both the facts and age-appropriate skills for interpreting these facts, social studies instruction is lacking an element to teach to its students.¹²² The authors take note of this, explaining that:

Using historical reasoning as the example, it can easily be demonstrated how little attention has been given to cognitive development as the basis for articulation between social studies subjects. Somewhere around the fourth grade real social studies begins (ask any fourth grader) ... Generally, this fourth grade space is labeled as state history whether it *is* history or not. Unfortunately, state history has been the popular choice without giving much consideration to cognitive development.¹²³

Moore, Alouf, and Needham go on to explain that the success of a social studies curriculum depends on the curriculum developer's understanding of what students are cognitively able to do in terms of representational thought, historical reasoning, and instructional concerns.¹²⁴ The development of representational thought, a critical development in the attainment of historical thinking, the authors argue, is based on Piaget's model, which establishes images as the first step in children's development of abstract thought.¹²⁵

¹¹⁹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 51.

¹²⁰ Ibid., 51-52

¹²¹ Ibid., 52

¹²² Ibid.

¹²³ Ibid., 53.

¹²⁴ Ibid., 54-63.

¹²⁵ Ibid., 54-57

Since art can be both a primary source and children understand this concrete representation of thought prior to understanding abstract concepts such as dates, which are traditionally used in social studies instruction, art is the most appropriate instructional tool to use in introducing both historical methods and historical content to young students.

Scholarship on Children's Art Historical Understanding

Following Parsons as well as Moore, Aloof, and Needham, Arizona State University educational researcher Mary Erikson explored the ability of students to interpret art as evidence of history to determine whether or not art history was appropriate for primary students.¹²⁶

Erikson argued that,

The physicality of art works as well as their imagic nature seem to support an argument that art historical understanding might be developmentally more appropriate for early childhood than traditional history which is centered on events rather than objects or images.¹²⁷

Erickson has come to the same conclusion as I have—art history may be a better way to teach children history than through events because of the representational quality of art. Erickson analyzes not the scholarship surrounding students studying history, as I have, but investigates more deeply the ability of students to ascertain style as a hallmark of art historical understanding.¹²⁸ As previously stated, Erickson defines art historical understanding as “the ability to interpret art works in their own historical-cultural contexts.”¹²⁹ In order to measure student's art historical understanding, Erickson used Michael Parsons' four stages of aesthetic response, the final stage of which represents art historical understanding.¹³⁰ Though Parson's

¹²⁶ Erickson, “Art Historical Understanding,” 63.

¹²⁷ Ibid., 64.

¹²⁸ Ibid., 63-64.

¹²⁹ Ibid., 64.

¹³⁰ Ibid., 63-65.

stages relate more to an enjoyment of art, or art appreciation, rather than art historical understandings, Erickson used these stages to analyze students' understanding of cultural-historical relationships within art.¹³¹ Erikson conducted a pilot study of two classes of 2nd grade students to determine the children's art historical understanding.¹³² In the study, Erikson led three 45-minute discussions with the first class and two 45-minute discussions with the other.¹³³ In these discussions, students were given reproductions of three ancient art works: a prehistoric cave painting, an Egyptian tomb painting, and Michelangelo's Sistine chapel ceiling.¹³⁴ In order to situate these artworks in the past Erickson explained the age of the works in terms that students could understand, using grandparents' ages.¹³⁵ After looking at the artworks, students were asked three questions about each artwork:

1. How was life different then from now
2. How life back then made a difference in the way the painting looked
3. What question they could ask to help them better understand the painting.¹³⁶

These questions allude to an understanding of the creating culture and original viewing audience of an artwork. They encourage children to step outside of their own experiences and create an empathetic understanding of societies in the past, which is associated with Piaget's concrete and formal operational stages.¹³⁷ This is also directly related to Parsons' fourth stage of aesthetic response, but some results were generally unrelated to the more aesthetic considerations of

¹³¹ Erickson, "Art Historical Understanding," 63.

¹³² *Ibid.*, 64.

¹³³ *Ibid.*

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*, 64.

¹³⁵ *Ibid.*

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*

¹³⁷ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 55.

children's interest in art in earlier stages.¹³⁸ So, while Parsons' hierarchy may not have been the most relevant structure for assessing the accuracy of students' art historical understanding, it did establish that younger students can understand art historical concepts. While some students grasped these concepts, Erickson's results reflected that her 2nd grade students generally fell into Parsons' stage two or three, with only a few notable students attaining Parsons' stage four understanding of art.¹³⁹ Erickson's conclusions show that students, even at the second grade level, have the potential through direct instruction to see art as a meaningful tool for understanding the past.

To this point, all three realms: art education theory, scholarship on the acquisition of historical knowledge, and nascent art integration studies support the idea that art aids young students in scaffolding ideas of time. Erickson's conclusion, in line with Piaget's theory of cognitive development, is that art may be more developmentally appropriate for children than traditional historical instruction, which consists of the presentation of events and ideas rather than a concrete means of understanding the past.¹⁴⁰ In this way, historical thinking skills—a piece theorized by Moore, Alouf and Needham as making up half of the goals of social studies instruction—has the potential to be introduced to students earlier.¹⁴¹ By introducing historical thinking skills in younger grades through a thoughtful discussion of art objects, schools will better scaffold and support their students in the pursuit of these skills. As a result, schools can expect a better understanding of history in their students even before reaching the upper grades, where a more rigorous historical curriculum is taught. The early instruction of history using art

¹³⁸ Erickson, "Art Historical Understanding," 65-66.

¹³⁹ Ibid.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., 64.

¹⁴¹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 51-52.

also contributes to an increased empathy for societies of the past, a greater cultural literacy, and higher scores on standardized tests related to history—such as the variety of College Board Advanced Placement history courses. Additionally, the cognitive development theory suggests that art would be a developmentally appropriate tool for introducing historical concepts and skills. If schools can introduce historical thinking skills earlier, contributing to a better understanding of history and cultural literacy, without it being developmentally inappropriate, why have art historical concepts been largely left out of current social studies curricula?

Scholarship on Arts Integration in Social Studies

In support of the new push for Arts Integration, in which students are instructed in art in combination with traditional core academic subjects, Julie Ann Taylor, Timothy Monck, and Sanaa Ayoub conducted a study of the way social studies educators use the visual arts and how it affects their students. As one of the only studies focusing on arts integration in social studies, this study provides a platform to judge the state of interdisciplinary study of art and social studies in schools. Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub conducted a survey of Midwestern educators in all content areas at the elementary, middle, and high school levels.¹⁴² Conclusions were narrowed from the 180 respondents to the 47 responses from social studies educators.¹⁴³ Of this group, roughly 57.4% of participants taught at the high school level, with equal percentages of elementary and middle school educators.¹⁴⁴ According to Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub, “nearly all [educators] expressed favorable opinions of arts integration.”¹⁴⁵ This is despite the fact that only 12.8% self-reported to integrate art into their classroom often, with the majority (61.7%) of educators

¹⁴² Taylor, Julie Anne, Timothy Monck, and Sanaa Ayoub. “Arts Integration in the Social Studies: Research and Perspectives from the Field.” *The Councilor* 75, vol. 1 (2014): 23.

¹⁴³ *Ibid.*, 24.

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

reporting that they sometimes use art in instruction.¹⁴⁶ Clearly, art serves an important role in social studies classrooms even now, as arts integration is in its early stages.

However, Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub's study, as one of the first on arts integration in social studies, is not without its flaws. The reader may notice that Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub have not clarified in the survey they sent out to teachers exactly what kind of art is included in the classroom.¹⁴⁷ When talking about arts integration in social studies, we have talked most about art history as a way of scaffolding historical thinking throughout the social studies curriculum. However, in elementary schools, most art is student-generated through activities to get students engaged and stimulate expressive language when students are not yet fluent in writing.¹⁴⁸ Therefore, teachers' self-assessment about the kind of art that they use and why they use it would seem to support the interpretation that, rather than looking at using fine arts to scaffold historical thinking, teachers are self-reporting any and all artistic activities conducted within the classroom. Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub found that 82.2% of social studies educators used drawings in their classrooms, while 26.7% and 17.8%, respectively, used the more traditionally art historical mediums of oil paintings and sculpture.¹⁴⁹ Teachers also overwhelmingly responded to the question "Why do you use art in instruction?" with some input about how art increases student engagement.¹⁵⁰ This is relevant to whether teachers are using fine or student-generated art in social studies instruction because both methods increase student engagement.

While both art making and arts integration increase student engagement, they may not do so to the same magnitude. Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub's study revealed that many educators find

¹⁴⁶ Taylor, Monck, Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 47.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.,

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., 27.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid., 24.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., 24-26.

theoretical support for integrating art into their classrooms through Howard Gardner's Theory of Multiple Intelligences.¹⁵¹ This theory supports using different ways of teaching material to "reach students with different aptitudes."¹⁵² Gardner's theory also supports the popular Response to Intervention strategy (RTI), which is implemented within Ohio's schools and is, therefore, relevant to this study.¹⁵³ RTI is implemented within Ohio's schools, so it is relevant to this study.¹⁵⁴ Essentially RTI is a strategy for identifying struggling students and supporting them as needed throughout their academic journey.¹⁵⁵ RTI consists of three tiers with varying levels of support for students. Students in Tier 1 are educated with the whole class and no extra support.¹⁵⁶ Students identified as not "making adequate progress in Tier 1," will receive additional help tailored to their needs.¹⁵⁷ Generally this means that the struggling student will be pulled out of the classroom at some point to work in small groups.¹⁵⁸ Key to the success of intervention, these small groups will be "using a different method than in Tier 1 because the first method wasn't successful."¹⁵⁹ Tier 3 works with a small percentage of students in more intensive interventions.¹⁶⁰ Student-generated art may be used generally as a class-wide Response to Intervention strategy to engage all learners.¹⁶¹ This sounds far more common than elementary

¹⁵¹ Taylor, Monck, Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 26.

¹⁵² Ibid.

¹⁵³ "Response to Intervention (RTI)." *Ohio Coalition for the Education of Children with Disabilities (OCECD) Newsletter* 2, no. 4 (July-Sept. 2017): 1-6.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid., 3.

¹⁵⁵ Ibid., 1.

¹⁵⁶ Ibid., 2.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., 3.

¹⁶¹ Ibid., 2.

teachers introducing fine arts to children, as the conclusions of Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub's study seem to suggest.

There are many hurdles for elementary teachers in introducing young students to fine arts. Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub identified a few and I would like to consider them here. While Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub concluded that "based on their observations of the positive effects of arts integration, they seek appropriate resources for incorporating art as well as professional development."¹⁶² However, this same study identified that "a number of social studies educators identified a need for greater access to museums."¹⁶³ It is possible that teachers may not feel empowered enough to seek out the resources their students would benefit from because of lack of expertise, budget constraints, or other confounding circumstances. This is true especially for teachers of the youngest learners, who have the most potential to learn historical thinking from art. As teachers have identified, arts integration would be a wider phenomenon if the incorporation of outside resources, such as those from museums, were more accessible.

Conclusion

A more rigorous social studies curriculum is possible to integrate into the primary grades through increased involvement and reliance on art objects. On a cognitive level, the way that art can come to represent cultural themes is more useful for young learners than the abstract ideas and images surrounding events and graphs used to display the passage of time to children. Historical thinking skills are necessary for students to develop empathy and make personal judgments based on evidence. Through integrating art to teach historical thinking skills at grades younger than traditionally taught history, students can gain more practice using these skills and

¹⁶² Taylor, Monck, Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 41.

¹⁶³ Ibid.

create better outcomes both academically and socially. Through Erikson's study, it is clear that an art historical understanding is possible among young students and, thanks to studies of the theory surrounding how children learn, art history can be established as more appropriate than history as traditionally taught in general education classrooms.¹⁶⁴ Arts integration provides a platform for the interdisciplinary study of social studies and art together but requires more resources for teachers to be able to best implement art history into their classrooms, as established by Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub.¹⁶⁵

¹⁶⁴ Erickson, "Art Historical Understanding," 66.

¹⁶⁵ Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 41.

Chapter 2: Implementation

Introduction

After discussing the potential developmental advantage of incorporating art history into social studies, it is natural to ask why this approach has not been implemented before. As previously stated, when art history is taught, it is generally done so in a self-contained art classroom alongside technical skills.¹⁶⁶ This again seizes on the dichotomy between arts integration and art education. As previously defined, art education focuses on the instruction of art-making skills, while art integration uses art to teach other disciplines.¹⁶⁷ Both are useful within the elementary school setting. However, analyzing the way that children learn and develop reveals that using art pieces as concrete examples of the construction and passage of time would aid students' understanding of this abstract process. Following this analysis, art history should be integrated into the way that elementary school students study the past in their social studies classrooms.

Art history is traditionally used in the primary grades through the art education model, in which limited historical context is provided for masterpieces, especially surrounding artists' biographies. This traditional instruction under the art education model means that there are resources available to guide instruction of art history within the art classroom. This scaffolding need not be thrown away entirely, it is possible to utilize these resources, meant to teach artistic skills, in a way that instead provides insight into the past. Teaching art history in general education classrooms using these art education resources not only gives children the opportunity

¹⁶⁶ Wan, Ludwig, Boyle, and Lindsay. "Arts Integration and Education," 37.; Seaboldt, "Defining Art Appreciation," 45.

¹⁶⁷ Wan, Ludwig, Boyle, and Lindsay. "Arts Integration and Education," 37.

to gain a strong foundation for historical thinking skills, but also utilizes art educators to encourage and teach general education teachers. This solves one of the most common problems cited as teachers attempt arts integration in their own classrooms—that the general education teacher does not have enough background knowledge to integrate art meaningfully.¹⁶⁸ Seizing upon the availability of art historical resources in art education classrooms, general education teachers can collaborate with art teachers to introduce art history within their social studies classrooms. In other words, the existing frameworks of art education can be used to create similar frameworks within the general education classroom to begin a further-reaching arts integration program. This will be modeled through a lesson-by-lesson unit plan at the end of this chapter. The implementation of art education’s resources gives teachers an advantage when teaching the cognitive and historical thinking skills expressed by Piaget and Blake, as discussed in Chapter 1. In this way, the established tradition of art education guides the implementation of art integration, especially as it is used in the social studies classroom.

Analysis of Existing Curricula

Public elementary schools show a track record of consistently underestimating art as a discipline, especially as a result of recent legislative decisions that have seen art educators stretched nearly to their limits.¹⁶⁹ This led to the development of programs such as Art in Action, a program which emphasizes that “through hands-on learning students expand their knowledge in art and art techniques, cultural understanding, technology, and more.”¹⁷⁰ Programs such as this

¹⁶⁸ LaJevic, Lisa. “Arts Integration: What is Really Happening in the Elementary Classroom?” *Journal for Learning Through the Arts* 9, no. 1 (2013): 1.

¹⁶⁹ Beveridge, “Fine Arts Classes,” 5.

¹⁷⁰ “About Art in Action.” Accessed 27 February, 2022. https://artinaction.org/about-art-in-action/?gclid=CjwKCAiAvaGRBhBLEiwAiY-yMKkLhdcplOASqytkwhlQ0V1IX-0E3Re_xHzP1Dxg-2FQxsQlZdkU-BoCPf4QAvD_BwE.

have developed curricula in which art history is used to teach art making skills in a separate classroom. While these technical skills are also necessary for students' development, the ultimate goal of a public-school education in the 21st century emphasizes literacy and math skills over all.¹⁷¹ As such, if public schools are looking to begin to incorporate art into their students' curriculum, it would make the most sense to take an arts integration approach, since both art and social studies are already receiving less instructional time than core subjects.¹⁷² However, this discipline is new enough that it does not have the kinds of outside support that art education does through programs such as Art in Action. One, very dated, approach to arts integration curriculum comes from a book called *Art in Story: Teaching Art History to Elementary School Children*. Through a consideration of this arts integration curriculum as well as an analysis of how art education frameworks can be translated into arts integration lessons, the social studies teacher can implement studying pieces of art as concrete exemplifications of key historical themes and styles. To demonstrate the difference between existing art education frameworks and the proposed movement toward art integration, I will analyze these existing programs which implement the study of art history in an appropriate way for elementary school students.

Analysis of Art in Action

Art in Action is an organization working to bring art into classrooms through curriculum planning and professional development opportunities.¹⁷³ While Art in Action's curriculum focuses on instruction with the goal of art-making, much of the curriculum incorporates art history. I have chosen this program specifically because it offers robust, well-received resources

¹⁷¹ For more on this, see Introduction, statement synthesized from U.S. Department of Education. *No Child Left Behind: Toolkit*. 2004. and Beveridge. "Fine Arts Classes," 5.

¹⁷² Beveridge, "Fine Arts Classes," 5.

¹⁷³ "About Art in Action."

for the art classroom.¹⁷⁴ Additionally, Art in Action is well established in curricular circles, as it has been in action for over 20 years. Finally, I chose Art in Action to analyze because their goals for students and curriculum design align with the goals of this study. Namely, Art in Action focuses especially on using art to develop in students “critical-thinking skills, ... visual literacy, ... and an appreciation of other cultures,” though it does still have the additional focus on “hands-on skills,” which is not necessary to a curriculum focusing on arts integration.¹⁷⁵ One drawback to this program is that, as an outside program in a discipline that students do not spend a considerable amount of time in, school districts may not elect to invest in this curriculum. However, many resources from Art in Action’s full, 9-level “spiral curriculum” are readily available on their webpage.¹⁷⁶ This “spiral curriculum” is made up of a different focus on aspects of art for each grade level, from wider themes like “Art Around the World” in 1st grade, to specifics, such as “Art and the American Experience” in 8th grade.¹⁷⁷ In this way, each grade teaches separate content, but builds on the content taught in the previous grade, therefore forming a spiral. Each lesson within the grade level has been labeled with a genre, project medium, length guideline, and integration notation.¹⁷⁸ For example, the 2nd grade Vincent Van Gogh lesson has been properly labeled as Post-Impressionism, will be a fingerpainting lesson taking 45 minutes, and has tie-ins with 2nd grade Language Arts standards.¹⁷⁹ In this way, Art in

¹⁷⁴ Art in Action. “Testimonials.” Accessed 27 February, 2022.

<https://artinaction.org/testimonials/>.

¹⁷⁵ Art in Action. “Art in Action main page.” Accessed 27 February, 2022.

<https://artinaction.org/>.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷⁷ Ibid.

¹⁷⁸ Art in Action. “K-8 Visual Art Lesson Program.” Accessed 27 February, 2022. 1-20.

https://11afyp2d1guh2o6cn33r70tr-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/ArtinAction_-K-8-ProgramCatalog2017-18.pdf.

¹⁷⁹ Ibid., 7.

Action has provided signposts for connections in the general education classroom, though it does not dictate what that integration might look like if the art educator and general education teacher work in tandem. Art in Action provides a platform with which students can study art in one classroom and clearly bring those techniques to bear in their general education classrooms.

Alongside all these benefits, Art in Action brings certain challenges for educators. As an expensive, outside curriculum, many districts have deemed it unnecessary. Due to such limitations, if the curriculum can be integrated into the general education classroom as well as the art classroom, schools may better justify the cost of such a thorough program. Perhaps instead of funding a social studies curriculum (in which many textbooks and programs fall short of the mark), the district instead enrolls in Art in Action's program and uses that curriculum for both social studies and the arts.¹⁸⁰ While there are still problems with this model, largely stemming from the fact that Art in Action is meant as an art education curriculum, this does provide the opportunity for an arts integration model based on an established program. The main problem with using Art in Action with little modification as a curriculum for social studies is that general education teachers will have to generally design their own lesson plans instead of relying on those provided, since Art in Action bases its relevant curricular tie-ins on nationwide standards.¹⁸¹ Should a school district not see the value in this curriculum or choose to go in a different direction with their art education courses, it is necessary to empower classroom teachers to seek out best practices for their students. Best practice clearly indicates that scaffolding art integration activities into the general education classroom through connections between art

¹⁸⁰ For more information on how social studies curriculum and textbooks vary between districts and across state line, see Goldstein, Dana. "Two States. Eight Textbooks. Two American Stories." *New York Times*, January 12, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2020/01/12/us/texas-vs-california-history-textbooks.html>.

¹⁸¹ Art in Action. "K-8 Visual Art," 2.

history and the social studies curriculum will benefit students' historical thinking skills in the long run. In pursuit of this, my study will design a unit based loosely around both *Art in Action* and another curriculum, *Art in Story*, to demonstrate how general education teachers can integrate art history within their classrooms.

Analysis of Art in Story

Through her framework, *Art in Story*, Marianne Saccardi literally wrote the book on integrating art history into the elementary school curriculum.¹⁸² Unlike *Art in Action*, *Art in Story* is a curriculum based around a singular reference book for educators. Since this curriculum is just a book, it does not provide as many resources as *Art in Action*, such as opportunities for professional development.¹⁸³ Additionally, Saccardi establishes her perspective in the Introduction that her book “is not a scholarly treatise but rather a practical guide to help teachers introduce world-renowned artists to their students.”¹⁸⁴ While this ambition is benign, Saccardi herself may not have been the most qualified for the job. Though the book “is the culmination of thirteen years of studying art history with children,” Saccardi herself started this project “armed with only a college survey course.”¹⁸⁵ Despite Saccardi's lack of art historical knowledge, her pedagogical practices are sound. Though the content of her lessons, stories based on artists' biographies, tend toward the apocryphal, her lesson planning strategies shine. For this reason, and the fact that Saccardi provides one of the only models for arts integration in the elementary classroom, her framework has been included for analysis.

¹⁸² Saccardi, Marianne. *Art in Story: Teaching Art History to Elementary School Children*. North Haven (Conn.): Linnet Professional Publications, 1997 (2nd edition).

¹⁸³ *Art in Action*. “Art in Action main page.”

¹⁸⁴ Saccardi, *Art in Story*, 6.

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid*.

To follow Saccardi's sound lesson planning model, it is necessary to understand the elements of her lesson and what end they serve. Saccardi's lessons are meant to be taught once a week for roughly an hour with "several components to hold the children's attention."¹⁸⁶ The first component is the story, which Saccardi has written from facts about the art, but without "[worrying] excessively about whether the facts [she] used were 100 percent verifiable or merely apocryphal."¹⁸⁷ Instead, the story was meant to serve as an emotional connection between the students and the artist.¹⁸⁸ After the reading of the story, the class is meant to view artworks belonging to the artist or culture under consideration.¹⁸⁹ Saccardi provides resources for teachers to find quality reproductions of these works throughout her book.¹⁹⁰ After viewing and discussing the art, students are prompted to write about it in a journal, whether personal or as a class.¹⁹¹ In this way, Saccardi's lesson can apply to younger students who do not have a firm grasp of their own writing skills yet, as well as older grades who can effectively use expressive language. Finally, each lesson ends with an art or drama activity.¹⁹² The activities and lessons from the whole year lead to a Culminating Activity, in which children "put on a play about some of the artists [they] had studied during the year."¹⁹³ This connects students to the art and drama activities that they had done throughout the year. In Saccardi's lesson plan, there is an element to grab students' attention, then a display of visual art, a reflective exercise connecting the background knowledge with the visual art, and concrete skill practice in pursuit of students' final

¹⁸⁶ Saccardi, *Art in Story*, 1.

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 2.

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 2.

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

¹⁹¹ *Ibid.*, 3.

¹⁹² *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁹³ *Ibid.*

assignment. This is a strong pedagogical practice that will be used in the creation of our arts integration curriculum, though our aim is to create a curriculum that is also factually accurate, which *Art in Story* does not provide.

Creation of an Art Integration Curriculum

When considering the creation of an arts integration lesson focusing on social studies, we must also analyze social studies frameworks guiding the creation of teachers' lessons. Since I am conducting this study and will be teaching in the state of Ohio, the Ohio State Social Studies Standards will guide the creation of this example arts integration unit. The Ohio State Social Studies Standards are broken into four different components to guide teacher's lessons—strands, themes, topics, and content statements.¹⁹⁴ Content statements are the smallest unit of the standards.¹⁹⁵ Contained within each content statement is the knowledge students are expected to walk away with upon completion of the grade level.¹⁹⁶ Content statements are sorted into topics and strands.¹⁹⁷ Strands represent the various disciplines present within the social studies framework—History, Geography, Government, and Economics.¹⁹⁸ Topics are strand-specific aspects of content, such as skills or motifs present in the material that should be presented in order to teach the content.¹⁹⁹ Finally, themes are the focus or narrative of a certain grade level.²⁰⁰ By using the Ohio State Social Studies standards scaffolded in this way, teachers are given a framework for their social studies lessons throughout the year. Using a 2nd grade example, teachers are responsible for teaching specific social studies skills, such as interpreting a map, in

¹⁹⁴ "Ohio's Social Studies," 3-5.

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 4.

¹⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

order to develop students' spatial thinking and skills, and recognizing that this skill is related to the discipline of geography.²⁰¹ Further, a 2nd grade teacher's lesson or unit on map reading should support the narrative theme of "People Working Together."²⁰²

It is this standard that I have just broken into its component parts that I would like to analyze at this time. When analyzing the Ohio State Social Studies standards, this standard seemed particularly relevant to cultural artifacts studied in a traditional introductory art history class from the settlement of Çatalhöyük in Anatolia. Çatalhöyük is a Neolithic site which shows a unique adaptation of humans to their environment.²⁰³ The houses of Çatalhöyük are built wall-to-wall, meaning that there are no streets and navigation around the settlement takes place on houses' roofs.²⁰⁴ Along with the highly defensible, cohesive plan for this settlement, Çatalhöyük is notable in art historical circles for the decorations of its interior, which survives to us in surprising numbers thanks to the people of Çatalhöyük's unique approach to housing.²⁰⁵ Rituals surrounding moving house involve filling in the old house with dirt and building a very similar structure on top of the filled-in original.²⁰⁶ Through focusing on the art historical aspects of the settlement of Çatalhöyük, teachers introduce their students to their global community while providing a platform to practice their emerging social studies skills, as dictated in the Ohio State Social Studies standards.

Using Çatalhöyük as an art historical example in social studies is relevant to elementary learning standards because of its connection to 2nd grade's theme, its employment of mapping

²⁰¹ "Ohio's Social Studies," 14-15.

²⁰² Ibid., 14.

²⁰³ Çatalhöyük Research Project. "Çatalhöyük: Site Guide Book," accessed March 9, 2022. <http://www.catalhoyuk.com/sites/default/files/Catalhoyuk-Guidebook-ENGLISH.pdf>. 2-3.

²⁰⁴ Çatalhöyük Research Project. "Çatalhöyük." 2-3.

²⁰⁵ Ibid., 10-11.

²⁰⁶ Ibid.

skills outlined in the 2nd grade standards, and its ability to generate empathy across cultural and temporal bounds. Çatalhöyük is especially relevant to the 2nd grade theme of “People Working Together” because the houses of Çatalhöyük were built wall-to-wall with no space for streets.²⁰⁷ Since this method of city construction is so drastically different from what students are used to, it can prompt them to think more thoroughly about characteristics of their community and others’. Current research being done at Çatalhöyük includes a digital reconstruction of interior spaces of interest.²⁰⁸ Since students learn from their own experience before being able to extend their knowledge to the unknown, this project provides a fantastic way for students to not only practice in engaging their new knowledge of mapping to an unfamiliar culture, but also engage with new discoveries around the sites. Finally, Çatalhöyük is relevant to 2nd grade learning through its cultural difference. As previously stated, city construction in Çatalhöyük did not involve the use of streets.²⁰⁹ By introducing children to this idea, they can begin to think about what their own society would look like if their cities did not include roads and increase the bounds of their knowledge and empathy. These reasons contribute to my choice of providing an example for a social studies unit based around art history using Çatalhöyük as an example, as these characteristics are all relevant to the 2nd grade social studies standards for Ohio. In the following pages, I will generate this unit both through a written defense of my teaching decisions as well as using the graphic lesson planning worksheet used by the College of Wooster, which will be displayed in Appendix B with all other teaching materials.

²⁰⁷ Çatalhöyük Research Project, “Çatalhöyük,” 2-3.

²⁰⁸ Lercari, Nicola. “Virtually Rebuilding Çatalhöyük History Houses.” In *Religion, History, and Place in the Origin of Settled Life*, edited by Ian Hodder, (University Press of Colorado, 2018): 263-266.

²⁰⁹ Çatalhöyük Research Project, “Çatalhöyük,” 2-3.

Lesson 1

In the first lesson of this unit, I will introduce the idea of mapping. This skill will be introduced before the art historical content of Çatalhöyük in order to give students the skills necessary to create a productive discussion about how their culture and that of Çatalhöyük are different, as expected in the state standards. The relevant content statement guiding instruction of this lesson comes from the Geography strand and has a Spatial Thinking and Skills topic: “5. Maps and their symbols, including cardinal directions, can be interpreted to answer questions about location of places.”²¹⁰ This content statement is one of two overarching goals for the unit, other of which will follow in the next lesson, with the third lesson intending to review knowledge learned within the unit and provide the opportunity for deeper discussions and connections. Namely, the goal of this lesson is to develop student’s skills surrounding interpreting maps and their symbols.

This lesson should begin with the teacher projecting a teacher-created map of the classroom on the board. Important and notable features of the room should be included on this map, including the arrangement of the desks, the classroom library, and the classroom door. The map can be projected during a classroom transition time, so that students are looking at and observing it before the teacher begins to ask them questions about what is projected. Then, when the teacher is ready to start the lesson, the teacher can bring the class’ attention to the projected map. The teacher should ask a series of questions to gauge students’ familiarity with maps, analyzing whether the students recognize their own classroom represented in a new format. Some example questions are included on the lesson planning document. Giving students an example of mapping by comparing the location of two identifying elements of the classroom,

²¹⁰ “Ohio’s Social Studies,” 14.

such as filing cabinets being to the right of the teacher's desk, demonstrates the process of mapping. After this example, the teacher should then ask students to repeat this process, identifying at least three elements of the classroom in the same way, to assess whether students are ready to start creating their own maps. At this point, the teacher should introduce the central activity of the lesson.

The central activity of this mapping lesson is creating a map of students' desks. Since this is a personal space that all students have ready access to reference, it provides an equitable alternative for students mapping their rooms or homes. However, while this practice is more equitable, it challenges students to turn a three-dimensional space that they cannot take an aerial photo of and transition it onto a piece of paper. For students struggling with attaining these spatial awareness skills, it would be appropriate to prompt them to lay the materials contained within their desk on top of their desk in the way that they are organized within the desk. With ready access to their desks, students should spend roughly thirty minutes mapping their space. Students should be encouraged to draw the opening of their desk at the bottom of the page so that all of the maps are oriented on similar axes. The teacher should project the time that students have to complete this activity on the board so that students can manage their own time. The teacher should remain accessible, though it should be encouraged that students turn to their neighbors before asking the teacher for help.

When this activity is complete, students should be randomly paired with people who they do not sit in a group with (since they may have asked for help from and shown their group mates their maps already). Students will then complete a Think - Pair - Share activity in which Student A shows Student B their map. The idea of a Think - Pair - Share activity is that students are working together to come to conclusions about new content. Throughout a conversation between

the two students, Student B should mark on a worksheet (included in the Appendix) three notable objects on their partner's map (for example, the most recognizable—the bed, a table, closet, or dresser, etc.). As part of this identification, the students will be practicing vocabulary learned in the first part of the lesson, such as the cardinal directions and words that show objects' relationships to other objects. Through this conversation and filling out this worksheet, both Student B's map reading skills as well as the accuracy of Student A's map drawing will be assessed. After filling out the worksheet, Student A should show Student B the arrangement of their desk and check the information on Student B's worksheet as Student B assesses the accuracy of Student A's map. The two should then switch, analyzing Student B's desk and Student A's worksheet. The maps as well as the students' worksheets will be turned in to assess student mastery of this content.

Lesson 2

Having introduced students to mapping skills and its accompanying vocabulary through personal examples from their classroom and desk, it is now time to introduce the historical content of this art integration unit. This will be a shorter lesson than the day before because students have been introduced to the more complex skill sets involved in this study already. The relevant content statements for this lesson come from the Historical Thinking and Skills topic in the History strand and the Human Systems topic of the Geography strand. They are: "2. Change over time can be shown with artifacts, maps, and photographs." and "8. Cultures develop in unique ways, in part through the influence of the physical environment."²¹¹ The central goal of this lesson is to develop student's awareness of unfamiliar cultures, how they differ from ours, and how we collect evidence of historical civilizations.

²¹¹ "Ohio's Social Studies," 14.

This lesson should begin with an attention-getter that the students are familiar with so that the teacher's instructions will be clear. Since this is a whole-group lesson without individual components, it is important to start the lesson off with the whole group's attention. The teacher should then build on students' prior knowledge by asking what they remembered about the last social studies lesson. Students should contribute to the discussion, but the teacher should state at the end of students' contributions that "maps answer our questions about the location of places" to connect Lesson 1 to its relevant standard.²¹² Students should then be informed about people who use maps in their jobs- connecting first to any parent's careers. This will segue into a discussion of archeologists and how they use maps systematically to discover things buried in the ground. The teacher can then introduce Çatalhöyük specifically.

As per constructivism, this lesson on Çatalhöyük will work to prompt students to construct their own systems of understanding through investigation rather than lecture-style teaching. In order to do so, students will build on their prior knowledge of map making to turn a 3-dimensional reconstruction of a Çatalhöyük history house into a map. The teacher will first orient the students as to where in the world Çatalhöyük is. Then, it is necessary to also inform students that this is how people lived in the **past**- people living in Turkey (the modern country containing Çatalhöyük) live more similarly to the way we do. Students will likely have questions about this and it is important to address these while also keeping in mind the focus of the lesson. In fact, at this stage, students may pick up on the first standard addressed by this lesson- that maps can be used to show change over time. After orienting students in time and space, the teacher can show students a video produced by the Çatalhöyük Research Project reconstructing

²¹² "Ohio's Social Studies," 14.

the “Shrine of the Hunters.”²¹³ Should students notice the title of the video, it is important to note that archeologists and art historians argue about the name of things all the time and we should interpret this space primarily as someone’s home.²¹⁴ Currently in the scholarship, the word “shrine” is used loosely for building plans which are repeatedly reconstructed, seemingly for ritual purpose.²¹⁵ Students should then be introduced to their summative activity of the day—mapping the space in the video as a class. Prior knowledge can be activated by again projecting the classroom map from yesterday to show how three-dimensional spaces in our everyday life can be turned into two-dimensional maps. Students may argue that it is too difficult, but the teacher should encourage students to observe the video closely and map the important elements first. What in this house looks like something they would have in their house? What is missing? When students have finished this mapping activity to the best of their ability, perhaps only pointing out three or four elements of the house on a map, the teacher should display the archeological map which helped the archeologist develop the virtual reconstruction of this space (included in the Appendix). The class may then want to have a short discussion about why the archeologist may have decided to make a video recreating this space rather than just showing people his map. Finally, to wrap up the lesson and introduce a transition time, the teacher should take a class vote (tallied on the white board and left intact for the next lesson) to see if students would rather live in their current communities or in Çatalhöyük. If there is time after tallying the answers, it would help students’ verbal defense and historical thinking skills to ask students to

²¹³ ArtasMedia. “Archaeology and CGI: The Shrine of the Hunters at Çatalhöyük.” YouTube. YouTube, December 5, 2012. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pAV8z6NesOA>.

²¹⁴ Lercari, “Virtually Rebuilding,” 268.

²¹⁵ Ibid.

justify or defend their answer—why do you think it would be better to live in Çatalhöyük than our community? Why not?

Lesson 3

The final lesson is meant to assess the skills students have learned because of this unit. For this reason, we are revisiting two key standards from the first two lessons. These are “5. Maps and their symbols, including cardinal directions, can be interpreted to answer questions about location of places.” and “8. Cultures develop in unique ways, in part through the influence of the physical environment.”²¹⁶ This lesson consists mostly of a story told by the teacher, as modeled in the lesson plans developed by Marianne Saccardi for *Art in Story*. However, to promote additional student engagement and provide a way for the teacher to assess student learning throughout the unit, students will follow verbal directions within the story to create a map of the Çatalhöyük settlement. This will not be an actual map of the settlement, which the teacher should establish with their students by acknowledging that the story they are about to tell is fictional and therefore not real. The story is only meant to help students with their mapping skills, not with establishing historical facts about Çatalhöyük. Throughout the lesson, students should be following verbal directions on a mapping worksheet (which can be as simple as a grid, though a more detailed example is provided in the Appendix). Students should be prompted to create a compass rose on their paper. They should now be familiar with the cardinal directions and will be assessed on their knowledge, since it is information they are expected to walk away from 2nd grade knowing. However, by having students label their drawings, the teacher can award partial credit for students tracking movements across the map correctly, even if they might not be in the correct direction, as long as they are using the directions on their compass rose.

²¹⁶ “Ohio’s Social Studies,” 14.

Each movement of the main character in the story should be mapped by the end of the story. An example of a completed worksheet will be included at the end of this lesson. The teacher can assess student's mastery of the skills utilized throughout this unit by consulting students' mapping worksheets after the story. Additionally, there is a place for questioning within the story, if the teacher thinks it is appropriate and useful for the entirety of the class. If a student has been struggling with mapping skills, requiring verbal responses to a question from the whole class is not a good idea. Finally, to reinforce the objective and wrap up the lesson, students will show their tables their maps in a Think-Pair-Share activity and use a cup system to assess their results. If all the maps match at a table, that table can display a green cup. If they all have different maps, they can display a purple cup to notify the teacher that the table may need additional support.

Many decisions have been made to create this story. It largely follows the design of Marianne Saccardi, but I have taken pains to integrate factual data coming from new discoveries out of Çatalhöyük. The first step of integrating this factual data was to identify what is currently going on at the site. Since Çatalhöyük is a UNESCO World Heritage site, its website with resources was fairly easy to find.²¹⁷ At this point, I began to read the scholarship and assemble my data. For example, the inspiration coming from focusing on the cooking practices of Çatalhöyük is supported by archaeological data. Ian Hodder noted that many bones found at the site, when analyzed, had “a black deposit often lining the inside of the ribs.”²¹⁸ This deposit ended up being soot from inside cooking fires. Hodder also noted that “winters in the area are extremely cold,” so imagining the first spring day at Çatalhöyük might have included the

²¹⁷Hodder, Ian. “Women and Men at Çatalhöyük.” *Scientific American* 290, no. 1 (2004): 79.

²¹⁸ Ibid.

opportunity to cook outside.²¹⁹ The layout of the house in our story follows the layout of the interior of the “Shrine of the Hunter,” building on children’s prior knowledge and engaging with the most recent scholarship, which identifies this building not as a shrine at all, but rather as primarily a domicile.²²⁰ Through integrating factual data from the most recently published works and projects coming out of Çatalhöyük, we improve upon the model set by Marianne Saccardi in *Art in Story* by creating a factually accurate, age-appropriate lesson that fits in with state standards for the 2nd grade.

Conclusion

When considering moving from the theory to the implementation of any new curriculum, it is vital that teachers feel empowered to integrate the new knowledge into their classroom. For arts integration, which as a new educational theory, does not currently have curricular models specifically for the social studies classroom, this may mean leaning on other models which use art history, but fail in some way. Here we looked at *Art in Action*, which provides the critical art historical frameworks needed in an arts integration program, but lacks the social studies focus. We also looked at *Art in Story*, which is not an ideal arts integration curriculum because of its factual inaccuracies. Rather than use either of these two curricula, I have demonstrated how teachers can synthesize their resources to create an arts integration lesson based on these critical frameworks and current art historical discoveries to best engage students in learning social studies content.

²¹⁹ Hodder, “Women and Men,” 79.

²²⁰ Lercari, “Virtually Rebuilding,” 268.

Chapter 3: Extension

Introduction

This study has sought to follow, through its format, the practice of teachers in the field—moving from the beginnings of an idea, its defense, and into a lesson in practice. In defense of the instruction of art history as a tool for understanding social studies in the primary grades, this paper has looked to constructivist philosophers. The reader will remember that constructivism is an educational theory that theorizes that student engagement with content leads to the connection of neural pathways in the students' brain, making learning meaningful. More specifically, Piagetian constructivism supports a model of cognition in which students begin to understand abstract concepts, like letter-sound correspondences, through symbolic experience. Building on these concepts, students respond to encoded meanings within images even before they can read or write. By extending students' reactions toward images into notable art historical works, teachers can redouble students' outcomes in the social studies. This is important as both instruction in social studies and the practice of art education are in danger due to initiatives prioritizing literacy and math skills. This paper thus moves from the theoretical defense of using art history to teach social studies in elementary school classrooms into a framework with which teachers can implement interdisciplinary study. However, that framework only addresses experiences within the classroom. To create a more complex picture of how using art to scaffold social studies learning can help students achieve better outcomes, I would like to address students' experiences in alternative educational settings through field trips. This consideration creates a more complete picture of student learning through seizing upon the public-school framework that encourages and scaffolds these experiences still exists for students during these

experiences. I would like to address students' experiences in alternative educational settings through field trips, as the public-school framework still exists for students during these experiences.

Science-Based Field Trips

Much research concerning field trips focuses on science-based field trips, rather than trips to institutions such as art or history museums. However, since both social studies and science have been de-emphasized in current curriculum plans, and studies surrounding field trips largely have to do with field trip outcomes, it is possible to translate the conclusions of these studies into similar aspects of social studies. In this way, though the research surrounding outcomes of social studies-based field trips is slim, it is possible to draw some parallels between the outcomes of science-based and social studies-based field trips. In a review of research on science-based field trips, Marc Behrendt and Teresa Franklin observed that "students who directly participate during a field experience generate a more positive attitude about the subject."²²¹ The interest and enjoyment that field trips emphasize for students does more for students than simply enriching their days; it actually improves student outcomes. Cwikla, Lasalle, and Wilner observed that "eighth grade students with an interest in science were significantly more likely to acquire science related careers than students with no interest in science."²²² In the research, field trips based around science curriculum proved to be useful tools to improve student outcomes through

²²¹ Behrendt, Marc and Teresa Franklin. "A Review of Research on School Field Trips and Their Value in Education." *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education* 9, no. 3 (2014): 235.

²²² Cwikla, J., Lasalle, M., & Wilner, S. "My two boots ...a walk through the wetlands: An annual outing for 700 middle school students." *The American Biology Teacher*, 71, no. 5 (2009), 274- 279. quoted in Behrendt and Franklin, "Research on School Field Trips," 235

enjoyment, a conclusion that, based on the public school curricular connection between science and social studies, can be translated into social studies curriculum as well.

While enjoyment has been proven to enhance student outcomes, conclusions coming from studies of science-based field trips are also more relevant to academic goals. Overall, field trips provide students with an opportunity to connect what they are studying in class to phenomena in the real world. This connection of experience to abstract thought forms the backbone of constructivism, allowing students to sort experiences into networks of prior knowledge and new stimulus. The Constructivist learning theory's role in field trips is especially relevant when students are studying art, since, as the reader will remember, constructivism relies first on the symbolic understanding of a concept before the ability of students to create abstract extensions. Further, these experiences spark students' interest and extend the learning environment outside the classroom, providing a new environment in which to practice behavior strategies necessary to student development in the primary grades. Tal and Morag describe a field trip as "student experiences outside of the classroom at interactive locations designed for educational purposes."²²³ Michie identifies five such educational purposes:

1. To provide firsthand experience;
2. To stimulate interest and motivation in science;
3. To add relevance to learning and interrelationships;
4. To strengthen observation and perception skills;e and

²²³ Tal, T., & Morag, O. Reflective Practice as a Means for Preparing to Teach Outdoors in an Ecological Garden. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 20, no. 3 (2009): 245-262. quoted in Behrendt and Franklin, "Research on School Field Trips," 236.

5. To promote personal (social) development.²²⁴

While these purposes are oriented toward a science-based field trip, students studying outside of the classroom in other subjects may experience similar outcomes. Key to the experience of a field trip is experiential learning, in which “learning consists of grasping an experience and then transforming it into an application or result.”²²⁵ Essentially, the function that field trips and experiential learning play in elementary students’ understanding is enrichment—that is, garnering students’ interest and providing a new environment in which students can practice skills learned within the classroom. This not only provides students with motivation to continue their studies, but also gives students a new forum for practicing the knowledge they have gained through classroom study.

Though most scholarship follows field trips for science-related purposes rather than social studies ones, these two disciplines are often lumped together in public schools, both taking a back seat to literacy and math skills. If our school system is treating these disciplines similarly, the conclusions created from an analysis of science-based field trips can certainly be translated into social studies field trips. These conclusions include the ability of field trips to engage students’ interest and subsequently encourage students to pursue career paths in fields related to their field trip experiences. Additionally, many studies have investigated the impact of using field trips to observe, in real life, the phenomena that is studied in in the classroom. This chapter

²²⁴ Michie, M. “Factors influencing secondary science teachers to organise and conduct field trips.” *Australian Science Teacher’s Journal*, 44 (1998): 43–50. quoted in Behrendt and Franklin, “Research on School Field Trips,” 236.

²²⁵ Kolb, D. (1983). *Experiential learning, experiences as the source of learning and development*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall. quoted in Behrendt and Franklin, “Research on School Field Trips,” 237.

thus seeks to analyze how a field trip connecting to social studies standards and focusing especially on art and social studies may be planned best in order to deepen students' understanding.

The National Council for Social Studies' Plans for a Field Trip

While most of the scholarship studying student outcomes after field trips relies on those field trips being science-based, the National Council for Social Studies has published its own short article providing insight into what makes field trips successful. The National Council for Social Studies has tabulated three key aspects to designing a successful social studies-based field trip.²²⁶ The first element to a successful field trip is alignment with curricular goals.²²⁷ Though this may take many forms, such as conducting the field trip at the beginning of a unit or as a summary of what has been learned at the end of a unit, the National Council for Social Studies re-emphasizes that a field trip is “an experience outside the classroom walls intended to further children’s learning about an instructional goal or objective.”²²⁸ This statement is congruent with the attitude toward field trips present in Behrendt and Franklin’s review of scholarship surrounding science-based field trips. In order to make this curricular integration meaningful, students must be engaged, the second aspect of a successful field trip.²²⁹ Specifically, the National Council for Social Studies recommends that students collect data during their field trip to foster engagement.²³⁰ The final important aspect to making a field trip meaningful is properly preparing the students for their experience.²³¹ The National Council for Social Studies suggests

²²⁶ National Council for Social Studies. “Planning a Successful Field Trip,” accessed February 27, 2022. <https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/publications/yl/1403/140307.html>.

²²⁷ Ibid.

²²⁸ Ibid.

²²⁹ Ibid.

²³⁰ Ibid.

²³¹ Ibid.

that preparing students for a field trip involves another three aspects—a discussion of objectives, a classroom resource to spark student interest, and a Field Trip Web (like a thematic web or a brainstorm map) to “help focus thinking and raise questions which can be answered during the trip.”²³² There are more logistical concerns included in the rest of the article, but these three aspects seem to be the National Council for Social Studies’ main concerns in regards to a meaningful field trip experience. The National Council for Social Studies outlines a plan for curricular integration, student engagement, and proper preparation to create a successful field trip.

A Field Trip to the Frist

Following considerations from both the National Council for Social Studies and the wealth of current scholarship surrounding science-based field trips, a model for how these experiences should be scaffolded specifically is necessary for the beginning arts integration teacher. Through the example of the Frist Art Museum in Nashville, Tennessee, which is an ideal venue for an art-based field trip for a multitude of reasons listed below, this model of an arts integration social studies field trip will take shape. As previously stated, the Frist is unique for many reasons. The first of which is the Frist’s Martin ArtQuest.²³³ This space is a uniquely experiential addition to the traditional art museum, which allows for art making alongside the display of fine art within the museum. The potential for this to enrich students’ field trip experience will be explored below. Alongside the Martin ArtQuest, the Frist is unique through its complete lack of a permanent collection. The Frist is a non-collecting museum, meaning that all exhibits in the museum are loaned out from other institutions or provided by the artists

²³² National Council for Social Studies, “Planning a Field Trip.”

²³³ Frist Art Museum. “Martin ArtQuest.” Accessed Feb. 27, 2022.
<https://fristartmuseum.org/martin-artquest/>.

themselves. The Frist has up to 12-15 exhibitions a year, with topics ranging from works of the Cuban diaspora to the history of the museum's Art Deco building.²³⁴ Thanks to this rotating program of exhibits, the Frist generates an ever-changing environment. Students who take a field trip to the Frist in their 4th **and** 5th grade year, for example, will not see the same pieces both times. This is often a consideration when schools are planning their field trips years in advance and is a key aspect to keeping student engagement and creating a meaningful field trip experience. The Frist museum model, using rotating exhibitions rather than a permanent collection, is another aspect that makes this museum the ideal place to take a field trip. The Frist has a mission "to present and originate high-quality exhibitions with related educational programs and community outreach activities."²³⁵ With this educational and community focus, the Frist provides a perfect case study for what resources can make a field trip worthwhile. Additionally, having worked in the Education Department of the Frist, I am familiar with, and have helped develop, resources that this institution uses to reach its mission. Finally, the Frist is unique in its wealth of pre-field trip resources.²³⁶ These will all be discussed in pursuit of modeling for teachers how they can collaborate with local institutions to develop their own resources based on institutions in their community. This is consistent with the emphasis of field trips explained by the National Council for Social Studies, which largely consist of social studies field trips geared around students' communities.²³⁷ The examples provided suggested that students collect data on their field trips, such as "rubblings of gravestone names and dates" at a

²³⁴ Frist Art Museum. "Exhibitions." Accessed Feb. 27, 2022.

<https://fristartmuseum.org/exhibitions/>.

²³⁵ Frist Art Museum. "About," accessed Feb. 27, 2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/about/>.

²³⁶ Frist Art Museum, "Schools and Educators." accessed Feb. 27, 2022.

<https://fristartmuseum.org/schools-educators/>.

²³⁷ National Council for Social Studies. "Planning for a Field Trip."

local cemetery, taking pictures of architectural styles in a historic downtown, or interviewing employees at local businesses.²³⁸ While schools in large, metropolitan areas may have the opportunity to work with great social studies-based museums, such as art or natural history museums, even a trip to the local historical society can provide a wealth of information and engagement for students. While many institutions have an Education Department with programs for students, resources for educators, and extension activities to make a field trip meaningful, these are not necessary and growing a relationship with a local institution can fill the gaps in resources for educators seeking to engage their students in social studies through field trips. Through the example of the Frist, teachers can begin to understand the kind of high-quality resources that they can collaborate to develop with local cultural institutions in pursuit of field trips. Using the resources provided by the Frist as a guide, I will provide an example of how these cultural institutions, especially art museums, can be used to create impactful experiences for students to connect history with art.

Along with their mission focusing on education and community, the Frist has a uniquely experiential focus within their museum. This experiential focus makes the Frist an ideal place to take local children for field trips, as this chapter has covered that the most important aspect of a field trip is the opportunity it provides for experiential learning. The Martin ArtQuest (MAQ) creates “opportunities to explore a range of art-making activities” in order to “[help] participants find their unique talents and voices, celebrate their creative energy, and have fun!”²³⁹ The MAQ is a space in which children can create their own art inspired by the contents of the galleries they have walked through. The MAQ is equipped with art making activities for all ages ranging from

²³⁸ Ibid.

²³⁹ FAM, “Martin ArtQuest.”

easels prepared for drawing to printmaking supplies. While the MAQ does not have a specific focus on art historical strategies that may directly relate to a social studies classroom, its activities and stations rotate around the theme of the exhibits in the museum, which are often based on art history.²⁴⁰ As such, the MAQ can be a vital component of an art-based field trip. Through the MAQ, the Frist seeks to integrate another aspect into the experience of an art museum that is more than the traditional silent contemplation of fine art. Children can look at fine art in the galleries and then move to the MAQ to create their own works inspired by what they have seen. For example, for the Alma Thomas exhibit, the MAQ has been transformed to include a puppet theater decorated with Alma Thomas' work. This is relevant not only to the art on view within the exhibit, but Thomas' own passions for puppetry. Unlike the traditional, no touching rule within art museum spaces, this theater is meant for children to put on puppet shows and experience Thomas' passions and inspirations, generating empathy with the artist.²⁴¹ The Frist's multiple elements—traditional museum exhibit space as well as the Martin ArtQuest—create an environment in which students can move again from abstract thought in the museum space into putting that learning into practice in the MAQ.

With so much information covered in so many exhibits throughout the year, the Frist offers many programs to members and educators alike to make sense of the main idea of each exhibit. The Frist's website has a special tab specifically for "Schools & Educators."²⁴² Within this tab are Educator Guides for current and past exhibitions, a link to Educator Workshops,

²⁴⁰ See, for example, Fig. 3, in which a theater was constructed within the space of the MAQ to allow for experimentation with marionettes, a key element of the exhibit Alma W. Thomas: Everything is Beautiful.

²⁴¹ Frist Art Museum. "Educator Guide: Alma W. Thomas: Everything is Beautiful," accessed February 27, 2022, <https://fristartmuseum.org/wp-content/uploads/Alma-Thomas-educator-guide-and-images.pdf>. 1-17.

²⁴² FAM, "Schools and Educators."

resources for planning school group tours, and resources for reserving Online Tours. While I will explore each of these resources individually, focused on planning a field trip to the Frist, background knowledge of these resources can also be used to scaffold conversations with local institutions to create resources unique to a teacher's local community.

The resources provided by the Frist are “pre-visit materials designed to prepare students for their experience at the Frist Art Museum.”²⁴³ Educator Guides contain connections to Tennessee State standards, background information in short passages for educators, guiding discussion questions, and ideas for in-class activities to connect to the content of the exhibit.²⁴⁴ This fulfills the both the first and third elements to a successful field trip, as described by the National Council for Social Studies—curricular engagement and properly preparing students for their trip.²⁴⁵ These Educator Guides exist in online PDF format for twelve former exhibitions, with print guides available for another 31 exhibits by request.²⁴⁶ Also included are a glossary of art terms and additional resources, such as books and videos produced by the Frist, to aid students' engagement with the exhibit.²⁴⁷ Educator Guides can be implemented in the classroom to create lesson plans appropriate for a class. For example, for our 2nd grade class from Chapter 2, I might read the class one of the books suggested in the additional resource section of the Educator Guide as an introduction to Alma Thomas and her artwork. After reading the short passages of background information myself to ensure that I understood the contents of the exhibit, I would seek a discussion with my students about Alma Thomas as an artist and

²⁴³ FAM, “Schools and Educators.”

²⁴⁴ FAM, “Educator Guide: Alma Thomas,” 1-17.

²⁴⁵ National Council for Social Studies, “Planning a Field Trip.”

²⁴⁶ Frist Art Museum. “Educator Guides.” Accessed Feb. 17, 2022.
<https://fristartmuseum.org/educator-guides/>.

²⁴⁷ FAM, “Educator Guide: Alma Thomas,” 1-17.

historical figure. This discussion could be scaffolded by discussion questions taken directly from the short passages in the Educator Guide, but I would not want to ask all of them as that might be overwhelming. After this lesson (or lessons) about the exhibit we were going to see, my students would be focused and ready to visually absorb and process the artworks on view. In this way, the Educator Guides on the Frist's website provide great examples of the way in which the Frist works to help educators scaffold field trips to its institution through detailed research on how art historical exhibits relate to curricular standards through an accessible, online format.

At this point, it would be helpful to go through the Educator Guide for a current exhibition at the Frist—*Alma W. Thomas: Everything is Beautiful*. The Educator Guide begins with a run-down of Tennessee State Standards covered in a consideration of this exhibit.²⁴⁸ For the Visual Arts Standards, professionals at the Frist have noted that students will fulfill the Respond and Connect domains through an interaction with the exhibit.²⁴⁹ They suggest activities to get students to fulfill the Present domain, including displaying art at their school to inform their peers about the considerations covered in this exhibition.²⁵⁰ Finally, Frist professionals suggest that students use the exhibit to inspire themselves as a way to fulfill the Create domain of the state fine art standards.²⁵¹ Moving into the core subjects, Frist professionals identify Alma W. Thomas' involvement with the Civil Rights Movement, specifically the March on Washington, D.C. as part of upper-level U.S. History standards.²⁵² For 1st grade, the Frist identifies standards connected to Earth and Life Sciences. For the Earth sciences, the Frist has identified the strong geometrical emphasis in Thomas' work and her interest in space travel to relate to students'

²⁴⁸ FAM, "Educator Guide: Alma Thomas," 1.

²⁴⁹ Ibid.

²⁵⁰ Ibid.

²⁵¹ Ibid.

²⁵² Ibid.

considerations of Earth's Place in the Universe.²⁵³ For Life Sciences, the Frist has seized upon Alma W. Thomas' interest in flora and fauna to integrate standards connected to Structures and Processes, especially the life cycle of plants.²⁵⁴ After covering the Tennessee State Standards relevant to the Alma W. Thomas exhibit, the Frist launches into several pages of background information into Alma Thomas' life and art.²⁵⁵ The first short passage covers Thomas' biography, then her rise to fame through a solo show at the Whitney Museum of American Art in New York City, at which she was the first African American woman to have a solo show.²⁵⁶ This passage is followed by discussion questions at a level which students could understand. The next passage covers Thomas' education followed by discussion questions and a suggestion for a still life drawing activity. Then Thomas is introduced as an educator with "creative connections ... between the theater, the classroom, and her home studio."²⁵⁷ Students are posed discussion questions and prompted with a drama activity.²⁵⁸ The Frist then covers the main themes of Thomas' work—the garden, the community, space, and her late works—all with discussion questions and activities. The guide ends with a glossary of artistic terms related to Thomas' work that have been emphasized in bold throughout the educator guide.²⁵⁹ Finally, the Frist has created a reference page with book resources for both adults and children, videos created by the Frist on color theory and color temperature (artistic techniques relevant to Thomas' practice), resources from the Chrysler Museum (a co-organizer of the exhibition) including a virtual tour of the

²⁵³ Frist Art Museum. "Exhibition: Alma Thomas," accessed Feb. 27, 2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/exhibition/alma-w-thomas/> .

²⁵⁴ FAM, "Exhibition: Alma Thomas."

²⁵⁵ FAM, "Educator Guide: Alma Thomas," 2-10.

²⁵⁶ FAM, "Educator Guide: Alma Thomas," 2.

²⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 6.

²⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 7.

²⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, 15.

exhibit and a Spotify playlist, a podcast from co-curators Seth Feman and Jonathan Frederick Walz, and a film on Alma Thomas' life.²⁶⁰ Clearly, the Frist works tirelessly to provide educators with not only background knowledge about exhibits on view, but also resources for integrating these ideas into their classroom to scaffold student learning and field trip experiences.

Educator Workshops build on Educator Guides, such as the one for the Alma W. Thomas show, as they are “programs [that] provide relevant connections and applications for almost any classroom or learning opportunity.”²⁶¹ During a workshop, educators will not only examine artworks, but also participate in gallery discussions, make their own art through studio activities, and develop teaching materials all related to the current exhibit on display. While these are available to all educators pre-K-12th grade in Davidson county, they appear to be very popular, as all three current Educator Workshops (*On the Horizon*- February 24th, *Alma W. Thomas*- March 3, *Alma W. Thomas*- March 5) are sold out, as they are limited to 20 participants.²⁶² Additionally, these workshops, since they include a breakfast, parking validation, and studio supplies, are \$30 per educator for members and \$35 per educator for non-members.²⁶³ For all of the educators teaching social studies in a school district, it would not be possible to attend these sessions, due to both cost and attendance cap prohibitions. However, Educator Workshops may be attended by a school's representative (perhaps an art education teacher) and relayed to other relevant educators through direct communication with this representative, as described in Chapter 2.

²⁶⁰ Ibid., 16-17.

²⁶¹ Frist Art Museum. “Educator Workshops,” accessed Feb. 27. 2022.
<https://fristartmuseum.org/educator-workshops/>.

²⁶² FAM. “Educator Workshops.”

²⁶³ Ibid.

Alongside all these opportunities for teachers to prepare for and reinforce the objectives of their field trips, the Frist also posts resources for the logistics and booking of school group tours.²⁶⁴ This includes an outline of gallery etiquette, or behaviors expected of the students while in the museum, an important element of field trips, as described by the National Council for Social Studies.²⁶⁵ Guidelines for group visits are included and require groups to be less than 50 students, with 2 chaperones for each 15 students for those in Kindergarten through 2nd grade and 1 chaperone for each 10 students for those in grades 3-12.²⁶⁶ The Frist offers both self-guided and docent-guided tours for exhibits open until June.²⁶⁷ Everyone under 18 has free entry into the Frist and the required number of chaperones get in free, with each additional adult being \$12 with groups of 10 or more.²⁶⁸ Using this information solely from the Frist's webpage, teachers can not only adequately prepare themselves and their students for a meaningful museum visit, but also book the tour or, in the case of a virtual experience, take the tour from the comfort of their own classroom.

However, not every institution has the same kind of resources as the Frist. How can teachers continue to support both these cultural institutions and their students' learning without these resources? At this point, it is helpful to remember that teachers need not reinvent the wheel. Undoubtedly, even local cultural institutions have done similar research as the Frist to put on their displays and exhibitions. Through a collaboration between representatives of the cultural institution, who know the content of the exhibitions, and the classroom teacher (or teachers),

²⁶⁴ Frist Art Museum, "School Group Tours," accessed Feb. 27, 2022.

<https://fristartmuseum.org/school-group-tours/>.

²⁶⁵ FAM, "School Group Tours." ; National Council for Social Studies, "Planning a Field Trip."

²⁶⁶ FAM. "School Group Tours."

²⁶⁷ Ibid.

²⁶⁸ Ibid.

who know the pedagogical strategies to relay the content of the exhibitions, producing resources like those produced by the Frist should not be incredibly taxing. This collaboration can even take resources from larger institutions such as the Frist as models for source material. In this way, teachers have created a strong plan for their field trip, encouraged a relationship with a local institution, and scaffolded student learning before the students have even entered the building.

The Impact of Seeing Art in Person

While the Frist offers various options for booking and scaffolding field trips to its institution, it also provides the option for classes to take on the experience of the Frist virtually.²⁶⁹ This option became especially useful in the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic as many art museums worked to make their collections more accessible to the public who were restricted to their homes. For some institutions, this took the form of digitizing their whole collection, but some notable institutions took the opportunity to digitize a full tour of works on display in their museum. For the Frist, these virtual tours are generally “Pre-recorded (asynchronous) docent-facilitated exhibition discussions.”²⁷⁰ Virtual opportunities to visit cultural institutions solve a common problem surrounding traditional field trips, but also propose a new problem of their own. First, the virtual field trip roughly eliminates the cost and biggest obstacle to a field trip. With any curricular experience outside of the school building, the biggest obstacle for schools is transportation, so having the opportunity to gain a similar experience to a field trip without having to transport students to or from a museum is a welcome way to incorporate field trips into social studies curriculum.²⁷¹ However, while virtual options for visiting art museums have expanded, there is much debate about if this virtual approach is as

²⁶⁹ FAM. “Schools and Educators.”

²⁷⁰ Ibid.

²⁷¹ National Council for Social Studies, “Planning a Field Trip.”

meaningful as seeing art in person. Seeking to better understand the duality of increased accessibility paired with steadily increasing art museum attendance, Brieber, Nadal and Leder recruited 137 psychology students from the University of Vienna to study their responses to the presentation of an exhibition in a lab versus in the museum setting.²⁷² Participants were placed in three groups based on where they would view the exhibition—the Museum-Lab (ML) group, the Lab-Museum (LM) group, and the Lab-Lab (LL) control group.²⁷³ They viewed the exhibition twice, once in each location for each group but the control group, and then evaluated their experience of the exhibition in each location.²⁷⁴ This study found that “ML and LM group participants rated all scales lower in the laboratory than in the museum, whereas there was little change in the scores awarded in both sessions by LL group participants.”²⁷⁵ These results led to the conclusion that “art is not isolated from the context in which it occurs.”²⁷⁶ Additionally, within the museum, “artworks were experienced as more arousing and more positive, more interesting and liked more.”²⁷⁷ If these results were observed with a group of adults, imagine the impact of art within the museum context for students. If field trips are meant to thoroughly enrich and interest students, this study proves that the most efficient way to do so is to take children to an art museum, rather than have them study it virtually. By coupling art with social studies, high-interest field trips to art museums can fulfill an educational purpose as well.

²⁷² Brieber, Nadal, and Leder. “In the White Cube,” 37.

²⁷³ Ibid.

²⁷⁴ Brieber, Nadal, and Leder, “In the White Cube,” p. 38.

²⁷⁵ Ibid.

²⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 40

²⁷⁷ Ibid., p. 41

Conclusion

Under current educational initiatives, student's opportunities to engage with social studies are severely limited. Instructional time is dedicated more toward subjects in which students will be tested on the national level, so that schools can remain funded and continue serving their students.²⁷⁸ In order to investigate if social studies can be studied better in the primary grades through integrating art, this study looked at how children learn. First, it took the big picture approach of representational thought following the cognitive development theory of Piaget. Piaget established that children learn through experience and progress from an understanding of images to an understanding of abstractions.²⁷⁹ Since students are thinking best through images in younger grades, the cognitive development theory supported my plan for integrating art history into K-5 social studies classrooms. But students in the primary grades are not only developing cognitively but are also developing specialized historical thinking skills. In order to determine what these were, this thesis looked specifically at how children learn history, gathering information from two different perspectives. The first of these historical thinking theorists, William Blake, examined the use of primary sources in comparison to secondary sources.²⁸⁰ The conclusion of this study was that primary sources are more effective in connecting students to content than secondary sources.²⁸¹ Since art history is reliant on pieces of art as primary sources of history, Blake's study also supports the integration of art into social studies curriculum. The other historical thinking theorists, Moore, Alouf, and Needham were

²⁷⁸ Beveridge, "Fine Arts Classes," 5.

²⁷⁹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49-64.

²⁸⁰ Blake, "Observing Children," 533-549.

²⁸¹ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49-64.

more interested in how to scaffold curriculum in order to support historical thinking skills.²⁸²

They concluded that students need to learn how to think historically as well as historical content.²⁸³ So, if art history is going to be integrated into elementary school curriculum, students must learn how to use art as a symbol of the past as well as the content of what we can learn about the past from art. With conditional support for arts integration from historical thinking theorists, this thesis looks for support from the visual arts as well. While there are limited resources incorporating art history and children's education, the sources that do are scaffolded on Parson's aesthetic stages, which establish children's understandings of style.²⁸⁴ One educator integrating art history into her social studies classroom was Mary Erickson, who established that children as young as 2nd grade had reached the upper levels of Parson's aesthetic understandings. In other words, Erickson established that art history is developmentally appropriate for children. The final theorists investigated in first, theoretically-based chapter were Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub, who investigated how arts are being integrated into social studies classrooms currently.²⁸⁵ Their conclusion was that, "directing resources to further arts integration in the social studies is warranted."²⁸⁶ This provided part of the impetus for my thesis, which will now move from the theoretical to the practical.

The practical implications of this theory support the integration of art and art history into the social studies classroom. So how should it be done? First, it is necessary to examine current art education frameworks, which integrate art history, but cannot be considered social studies because of their emphasis on technical skill. The first curriculum examined was Art in Action,

²⁸² Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49-64.

²⁸³ Ibid.

²⁸⁴ Parsons, Johnston, and Durham. "Children's Aesthetic Responses." 83-104.

²⁸⁵ Taylor, Monck, and Ayoub, "Arts Integration," 23-48.

²⁸⁶ Ibid., 41.

which is a fantastic program founded on solid principals, but does not provide enough social studies integration to be implemented any more than sporadically in a social studies classroom. Then, *Art in Story* was analyzed, which is also pedagogically sound, but is often factually incorrect. So how do teachers decide between these two or set off on their own? I began to make a curriculum for the integration of art history in the classroom, based around Ohio State Social Studies Standards and borrowing from the methods of pedagogy for both *Art in Action* and *Art in Story*. These three lessons are detailed and lesson plans are included in Appendix B.

While creating an arts integration curriculum for social studies is necessary for the furthering of the discipline, does learning end in the classroom? Obviously not, and so I included in this study extracurricular tasks over which teachers retain some control. The best example, which was supported by research to increase student outcomes, were field trips.²⁸⁷ On a field trip, students put into practice knowledge they have learned in the classroom, which again relates to Piaget and children's cognitive development.²⁸⁸ However, not every museum has these resources. So it was necessary to detail these resources in order to allow teachers to work collaboratively with art education professionals and local institutions to effectively generate materials to support their student's understandings of time and art.

This study has proven novel because arts integration is still a nascent discipline. As established by my thesis, arts integration has a valuable role in the classroom. This study has served as a model for integrating art into social studies classrooms. Arts integration takes experiential learning as an opportunity for students to engage in social and civic thinking, to approach others responsibly, and entertain students as makers of narrative. All of these skills are

²⁸⁷ Behrendt and Franklin, "Research on School Field Trips," 235-245.

²⁸⁸ Moore, Alouf, and Needham, "Cognitive Development," 49-64.

deepened within the high school curriculum. However, these skills can be scaffolded in the primary grades and enriched through using art as a critical lens for framing history.

Appendix A: Figures



Figure 1:
Michelangelo. 1501-1504. David, frontal view. Place: Galleria
dell'Accademia (Florence, Italy).

https://library.artstor.org/asset/LESSING_ART_1039490336.



Figure 2:

Mbudye Society, Luba Peoples (Democratic Republic of Congo). Lukasa (memory board). c. 19th to 20th century. <https://www.khanacademy.org/humanities/ap-art-history/africa-apah/central-africa-apah/a/lukasa-memory-board-luba-peoples>.



Figure 3.

Puppet theater in the Frist Art Museum's Martin ArtQuest for the exhibition
"Alma Thomas: Everything is Beautiful."

Courtesy of the Frist Art Museum's Instagram.

Appendix B: Lesson Plans and Worksheets



Department of Education - Lesson Plan Template

Figure 4: Lesson Plan for Lesson 1

General Information		
Grade: 2	Subject(s)/Class: Social Studies	Time Allotment: 15 mins instruction, 30 mins to draw maps, 15 mins for assessment (1 hour)
State Standard: 5. Maps and their symbols, including cardinal directions, can be interpreted to answer questions about location of places.		

Lesson Objective
<p>What will the students be able to <i>DO</i> during the lesson?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify and analyze a map of their own classroom Generate a map of their room (students will need to bring in/email a picture of their room)
<p>What will the students <i>LEARN</i> as a result of participating?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How to read, use, and generate maps Spatial awareness
<p>How will you <i>KNOW/ASSESS</i> that they learned what you expected (see <i>Assessment Resource Table</i> if you need ideas)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students will be mapping their rooms using a photo of their room, compare map to photo <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher will be available for questions and help, students are still working on left => right differentiation. Think Pair Share activity for students to share their maps of their bedrooms <ul style="list-style-type: none"> "So you have a little table to THIS side of your bed"

Environment and Materials
<p>Student Grouping (i.e. whole class, small groups, individual instruction/practice):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Class will be in their desk pods, 4-5 students to a pod Whole class instruction will be provided at the beginning of the lesson, then questions should be directed to students in pods before approaching the teacher Think -> Pair -> Share will take place for students not in the same pod, the room will be reorganized into partners

Room Arrangement(s):

- 4-5 pods of 4-5 students in the middle of the classroom
 - Loosely oriented towards the projector

Materials and Equipment (including technology resources):

- Photos of students' bedrooms (prompted and provided before class)
- Map of the classroom
- Projector and screen connected to teacher computer
- Oversized (12 x 16) cardstock paper
- Crayons
- Pencils
- Straight edge (rulers)
- Mapping worksheet (included at end of lesson plan, print on half sheet)

Lesson Introduction (Hook)**How will you engage and motivate students in the topic of this lesson?**

- Relate mapping to their personal experience (demonstrating through a map of their classroom, asking them to map their bedrooms)

Teaching Procedure/Practice


Provide a step-by-step description of what you will do throughout the lesson. Be very descriptive. This section should be a bulleted list for ease of use during the lesson.

- While moving from one lesson to the next, the map of the classroom will be projected on the screen
- At the beginning of the lesson, the teacher will draw students' attention to the projection
 - "Have you seen something like this before?"
 - "What is this kind of drawing called?"
 - "Why draw in this kind of way?"
 - "What do we see in this drawing? Does anyone recognize it?"
 - "This is our classroom, I have **mapped** everything in our classroom. Do you see how, in our classroom, the file cabinets are by my desk? Let's look at my map—there, look, the file cabinets are by my desk!"
 - Ask students to identify at least 3 more elements of the classroom in "real life" and on the map
 - "Now, I drew this map for our substitute, so that if I am not here, someone who has never been in our classroom would know where they can find things."
 - "How would they know where to find things?" => symbols on the map, also **cardinal directions**
- "Now, we all have a personal space that we can map. We are going to use our **desks** as practice to help us learn more about mapping. Then I will put you in pairs to talk about the maps of your desk and how they look in comparison to how they look "in real life." I want you to put the opening of your desk at the bottom of your paper. You may talk as we complete this mapping activity, but please stay focused. We will be mapping for about 30 minutes, I will project our time on the board. Ask any questions you have to your deskmates before asking me. I will be walking around to make sure that everyone is doing alright, so don't worry if you're a little confused, just get started!"
- Students will take approximately 30 mins. To draw out their maps of their desks. A timer will be displayed on the board to help students manage their time.
- When the timer goes off, students will be reorganized into pairs using popsicle sticks (or any other random sorting method used in the classroom). The teacher should have completed this randomization while students were working so that students can transition from one activity to the next smoothly
 - Pairs will be asked to show their partner:
 - 1- Their map
 - Their partner will identify where 3 important things are in the room- bed, table, closet, dresser, etc. (using a worksheet so that the teacher can assess students' mastery).
 - 2- Their desk
 - The partner will assess the accuracy of the map using their answers on the worksheet for the 3 important things


Closing Activities/Summary
<p>How will you end the lesson in a meaningful way, reinforce/revisit the objective?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Think -> Pair -> Share, allow students to share and discuss their work Using a worksheet, assess the accuracy of students reading of maps and their creation of the maps

Figure 5. Worksheet for Lesson 1


I SEE ...



_____ to the _____ of _____.



_____ to the _____ of _____.



_____ to the _____ of _____.




Figure 6: Lesson Plan for Lesson 2

General Information		
Grade: 2	Mentor:	Time Allotment: 30 mins.
<p>State Standard: 2. Change over time can be shown with artifacts, maps, and photographs.</p> <p>8. Cultures develop in unique ways, in part through the influence of the physical environment.</p>		
Lesson Objective		
<p>What will the students be able to <i>DO</i> during the lesson?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explore an early house at Çatalhöyük Generate a map (as a class) of the house they have seen on video 		
<p>What will the students <i>LEARN</i> as a result of participating?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cultures develop differently 		

- Sense of how people lived in the past
- Key information about Çatalhöyük—houses whose doors are on the ceiling, growing the city horizontally rather than vertically, etc.

How will you **KNOW/ASSESS** that they learned what you expected (see *Assessment Resource Table* if you need ideas)?

- Questioning
- Class Vote

Environment and Materials

Student Grouping (i.e. whole class, small groups, individual instruction/practice):

- Class will be in their desk pods, 4-5 students to a pod
- Whole class instruction

Room Arrangement(s):

- 4-5 pods of 4-5 students, oriented loosely toward the projection screen

Materials and Equipment (including technology resources):

- Laptop hooked up to a projector
- Archeology and CGI video - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pAV8z6NesOA>
 - Taken from Çatalhöyük Research Project: http://www.catalhoyuk.com/project/bringing_catalhoyuk_to_life
- Document camera (for generating class' map of Çatalhöyük room)

Lesson Introduction (Hook)

How will you engage and motivate students in the topic of this lesson?

- Connect to the activity they did in Lesson 1
- Introduce the idea of cartographers and archeologists—some people make maps as part of their jobs, let's look at some of them

Teaching Procedure/Practice

Provide a step-by-step description of what you will do throughout the lesson. Be very descriptive. This section should be a bulleted list for ease of use during the lesson.

- Whole group attention-getter
- "So yesterday we mapped our own spaces. Today, we are going to look at how maps are used by adults for doing their jobs. We know how maps worked because we used them to tell each other about ourselves—maps answer our questions about the location of places."
 - "Using what we know about maps, we are going to become archeologists—people who dig in the ground to find what is left of cities in the past. They use whatever they can find (which is sometimes just parts of walls) to figure out how people lived a long time ago."
- "So, to become archeologists, we are going to look at some work an archeologist already did for us."
 - Display world map with large red dot where we are and large red dot at approx. site of Çatalhöyük
 - "Not only are we going to travel into the past, we are also going across the world. Do you think someone's bedroom in Turkey, the country we are going to, would look just like your's? Why or why not?" - take approx. 2-3 answers, enough so that you can assess that students understand that they are separated from this people by **time and place**
 - Show video of The Shrine of the Hunters (try your best not to let students see the title of the video- "shrine" is a misnomer)
 - "Now you guys, I'm going to keep the video playing. What do you notice? Where is the door? Is there a bed? How do they cook their food?"
- "Now we're going to put our mapping skills to the test! Let's map this room in Çatalhöyük based on the video we just saw. After we make our map, I'll show you what this archeologist's map looks like."

- Create map as a whole class using a document camera or SmartBoard
- Upon completing the class' map, show the students the archeologist's map of Shrine of the Hunters, found at: <https://artasmedia.com/2015/03/10/catalhoyuk-the-shrine-of-the-hunters-f-v-i/>
- Then show students the ruins that helped the archeologist develop the map
 - "Do you think you would be able to develop a map using just what we see in this picture? What do you think about this? How does it tell us about the people who lived before us?"
- Class Vote wrap-up: Would you rather live in Çatalhöyük or your room?
 - After tallying responses, encourage discussion about why students chose one way or another

Closing Activities/Summary

How will you end the lesson in a meaningful way, reinforce/revisit the objective?

- Encourage students to contribute their knowledge through a class vote
- Have students qualify whether they would want to live in the past or not in order to assess that they have gotten a full view of how the map of Çatalhöyük can tell us about the past

Figure 7: Lesson Plan for Lesson 3

General Information

Grade: 2

Subject(s)/Class: Social Studies

Time Allotment: 30 mins.

State Standard: 5. Maps and their symbols, including cardinal directions, can be interpreted to answer questions about location of places.
8. Cultures develop in unique ways, in part through the influence of the physical environment.

Lesson Objective

What will the students be able to *DO* during the lesson?

- Reflect on what they have learned in previous lessons

What will the students *LEARN* as a result of participating?

- How people in the past lived in Çatalhöyük
- Practice with mapping skills

How will you *KNOW/ASSESS* that they learned what you expected (see *Assessment Resource Table* if you need ideas)?

- Students will create a map of the Catalhoyuk settlement based on verbal directions

Environment and Materials

Student Grouping (i.e. whole class, small groups, individual instruction/practice):

- Class will be in their desk pods, 4-5 students to a pod
- Activities will be led by the teacher from the front of the room, but students will fill out their own maps individually

Room Arrangement(s):

- 4-5 pods of 4-5 students in the middle of the classroom
 - Loosely oriented towards the projector
- Teacher on a stool/chair at the front of the room

Materials and Equipment (including technology resources):

- Mapping worksheet for students

Lesson Introduction (Hook)**How will you engage and motivate students in the topic of this lesson?**

- Project prior images of the Çatalhöyük settlement to transition students into the environment they are studying

Teaching Procedure/Practice

Provide a step-by-step description of what you will do throughout the lesson. Be very descriptive. This section should be a bulleted list for ease of use during the lesson.

- As a final practice with mapping skills, students will listen to a story told by the teacher at the front of the room.
 - Using these verbal directions, students will map their way around their version of the Çatalhöyük settlement
 - To make sure that students know they will not be getting actual directions around the **real** Çatalhöyük site, ask students what your job is—"Am I an archeologist? Do you think I have ever been to Turkey? Well, not yet, maybe this summer. I am going to read you a story. It is fiction. What does that mean? [class answer: it's not real] Right, this story is not real. We are going to create our own maps through the words I am telling you. Like a maze, but I can't see if you're going the right direction. This story is going to help us use our mapping skills."
- Story:

When I woke up, it was warm. A beam of light shone onto our mat on the floor, where my little sister was still warm, but my parents' places were empty. I smelled some far-off cooking fires, but hoped my parents had not yet stoked the fire in our home. When it was finally warm, we tended to eat outside. Eating outside meant that I could move around our neighbors' roofs to find my friends. Maybe we could sneak a few games in as our parents made some food. Thinking about how exciting it would be to stand in the sun and play games on our roofs with my friends again after a long winter of indoor dinners, I got off our mat. My parents were sitting on the floor at our feet talking softly, but the fire was not yet stoked. My mother rubbed her tired face, telling me that we could once again make our food outside in the presence of friends. I hustled up our ladder to the roof and breathed in the fresh air before hopping up and looking around. Some people were sitting out on their connecting roofs and I waved, shielding my eyes from the morning sun to see if I could see any of my friends. At the moment, I could not, so I decided to find them. I started at the roof of my family's home and then went...

 - To the east—my friend Mylitta lived 3 houses east of ours. Her father and mine had hunted a large bull when they were just a few years older than us and I knew she would be welcome at our celebration. When I got to Mylitta's I peeked in through the hole in their roof—her mother sat there weaving a basket. "Mylitta isn't awake yet, but I'll let her know to go to your house when she wakes up." She said, without looking up from her basket.
 - I left Mylitta's roof and turned North- my friend Gibil lived 2 houses North of Mylitta. He was standing on his roof, tossing around some animal knuckles we used to play games. "So how long until we eat?" Was his only question. "I think we need to run around and find some more friends first, Mylitta needs some time to wake up and my parents haven't even started the fire yet."
 - Gibil and I traveled one house to the West to see if any more of his family was awake and willing to contribute to our meal. Gibil shouted down into the house and sleepy voices answered saying they would bring food out onto the roof in a while.
 - 3 houses to the South, we found our friend Igigi and we raced to the next house.
 - We found the final guest for our meal 2 houses to the West—another friend, ready to eat until we were stuffed and lay on the roof for the rest of the day, sitting in the sun. Ninhursag followed us over the roofs back to my house, leaping like a bird over the housing supports.

(At this point, the teacher may want to ask how far away the main character's house is from Ninhursag's)

With all of our guests gathered on my roof, we all collectively took a deep breath, out from the thick, sooty air from the burning of our home fires throughout the winter. The smell of meat cooking in the open air made all of our friends hungrier after our trip through Çatalhöyük.

References:

Hodder, Ian. Women and Men at Çatalhöyük. January 1, 2005. Scientific American.

<https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/women-and-men-at-atalhyk-2005-01/>

Atalay, Sonya and Hastorf, Christine. "Food, Meals, and Daily Activities: Food Habitus at Neolithic Çatalhöyük." American Antiquity 71(2). Pp. 283-319.

Closing Activities/Summary

How will you end the lesson in a meaningful way, reinforce/revisit the objective?

- Students will do a miniature Think-Pair-Share at their tables, showing the maps they have created to their group mates to see if they differ widely or are generally the same
- Cups will be handed out based on the percentage of matching maps (ex.: red cup for they're all different, purple for two matching, yellow for three that look the same, green for all matching)

Bibliography

ArtasMedia. "Archaeology and CGI: The Shrine of the Hunters at Çatalhöyük." YouTube.

YouTube, December 5, 2012. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pAV8z6NesOA>.

Aulinger, B. "Social History of Art." *Grove Art Online*. 2003; accessed, 4 Mar. 2022.

<https://doi.org/10.1093/gao/9781884446054.article.T079457>.

Barkan, Leonard. *Unearthing the Past: Archaeology and Aesthetics in the Making of Renaissance Culture*. New Haven (Conn.): Yale University Press, 1999.

"Become a Teacher in Ohio." Accessed March 3, 2022. <https://teach.com/careers/become-a-teacher/teaching-credential/state-requirements/ohio/>.

Behrendt, Marc and Teresa Franklin. "A Review of Research on School Field Trips and Their Value in Education." *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education* 9, no. 3 (2014): 235-245.

Beveridge, Tina. "No Child Left Behind and Fine Arts Classes." *Arts Education Policy Review* 111 (2010): 4-7.

Blake, David W. 1981. "Observing Children Learning History." *The History Teacher* 14, no. 4 (August 1981): 533-549.

Brieber, David, Marcos Nadal, and Helmut Leder. "In the White Cube: Museum Context Enhances the Valuation and Memory of Art." *Acta Psychologica* 154 (2015): 36-42.

Boz, Başak and Lori D. Hager. "Living Above the Dead: Intramural Burial Practices at Çatalhöyük." In *Humans and Landscapes of Çatalhöyük*, edited by Ian Hodder. Vol. 47, 413-440. British Institute at Ankara, 2013.

Çatalhöyük Research Project. “Çatalhöyük: Site Guide Book,” accessed March 9, 2022.

<http://www.catalhoyuk.com/sites/default/files/Catalhoyuk-Guidebook-ENGLISH.pdf>.

Collins, Bradford R. “What is Art History?” *Art Education* 44, no. 1 (January 1991): 53-59.

Council for Basic Education. *Academic atrophy: The condition of the liberal arts in America’s public Schools*. <http://downloads.ncss.org/legislative/AcademicAtrophy.pdf> (accessed June 27, 2008).

Cwikla, J., Lasalle, M., & Wilner, S. “My two boots ...a walk through the wetlands: An annual outing for 700 middle school students.” *The American Biology Teacher*, 71, no. 5 (2009), 274- 279.

Erickson, Mary. “Chapter 13: Art Historical Understanding in Early Childhood.” In *The Visual Arts and Early Childhood Learning*, edited by Christine Marmé Thompson, 63-66. Reston, VA: National Art Education Association, 1995.

“Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA): A Comprehensive Guide.” Accessed February 27, 2022. <https://www.everystudentsucceedsact.org/>.

Frist Art Museum. “About,” accessed Feb. 27, 2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/about/>.

Frist Art Museum. “Exhibition: Everything is Beautiful,” accessed February 27, 2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/exhibition/alma-w-thomas/>.

Frist Art Museum. “Educator Guides.” Accessed Feb. 17, 2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/educator-guides/>.

Frist Art Museum. “Educator Guide: Alma W. Thomas: Everything is Beautiful,” accessed February 27, 2022, <https://fristartmuseum.org/wp-content/uploads/Alma-Thomas-educator-guide-and-images.pdf>. 1-17.

- Frist Art Museum. "Educator Workshops," accessed Feb. 27.
2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/educator-workshops/>.
- Frist Art Museum. "Exhibitions." Accessed Feb. 27,
2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/exhibitions/>.
- Frist Art Museum. "Martin ArtQuest." Accessed Feb. 27,
2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/martin-artquest/>.
- Frist Art Museum, "School Group Tours," accessed Feb. 27,
2022. <https://fristartmuseum.org/school-group-tours/>.
- Frist Art Museum. "Schools and Educators," accessed February 18, 2022,
<https://fristartmuseum.org/schools-educators/>.
- Goldstein, Dana. "Two States. Eight Textbooks. Two American Stories." *New York Times*, January 12, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2020/01/12/us/texas-vs-california-history-textbooks.html>.
- Kamii, Constance and Janice K. Ewing. "Basing Teaching on Piaget's Constructivism."
Childhood Education 72, vol. 5 (1996): 260-264.
- Hodder, Ian. "Women and Men at Çatalhöyük." *Scientific American* 290, no. 1 (2004): 76-83.
doi:10.1038/scientificamerican0104-76.
- Kolb, D. *Experiential learning, experiences as the source of learning and development*.
Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 1983.
- Korte, Gregory. "The Every Student Succeeds Act vs. No Child Left Behind: What's changed?"
USA Today, December 10, 2015.
<https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/politics/2015/12/10/every-student-succeeds-act-vs-no-child-left-behind-whats-changed/77088780/>.

LaJevic, Lisa. "Arts Integration: What is Really Happening in the Elementary Classroom?"

Journal for Learning Through the Arts 9, no. 1 (2013): 1-28.

Lercari, Nicola. "Virtually Rebuilding Çatalhöyük History Houses." In *Religion, History, and*

Place in the Origin of Settled Life, edited by Ian Hodder, 263-282: University Press of Colorado, 2018.

Loveless, Tom. "The Peculiar Politics of No Child Left Behind." Thesis, Brookings Institution,

2006. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/the-peculiar-politics-of-no-child-left-behind/>.

Michie, M. "Factors influencing secondary science teachers to organise and conduct field trips."

Australian Science Teacher's Journal, 44 (1998): 43–50.

Moore, Jerry R., James L. Alouf, and Janie Needham. "Cognitive Development and Historical

Reasoning in Social Studies Curriculum." *Theory and Research in Social Education* 12, vol. 2 (1984): 49-64.

Moss, Juliet. "Lukasa (memory board) (Luba peoples)," accessed March 9, 2022.

<https://www.khanacademy.org/humanities/ap-art-history/africa-apah/central-africa-apah/a/lukasa-memory-board-luba-peoples>.

National Council for Social Studies. "Planning a Successful Field Trip," accessed February 27,

2022. <https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/publications/yl/1403/140307.html>.

Ohio Department of Education. "Ohio's Learning Standards for Social Studies." Adopted Jan.

2019, last modified Jan. 1, 2022.

<https://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Ohio-s-Learning-Standards-for-Social-Studies/SSFfinalStandards01019.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US>.

Paoletti, John T. and Gary M. Radke. *Art in Renaissance Italy*. New York: H.N. Abrams, 1997.

2nd edition.

- Parsons, Michael, Marilyn Johnston, and Robert Durham. "Developmental Stages in Children's Aesthetic Responses." *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 12, vol. 1 (1978): 83-104.
- "Response to Intervention (RTI)." *Ohio Coalition for the Education of Children with Disabilities (OCECD) Newsletter* 2, no. 4 (July-Sept. 2017): 1-6.
- Sabol, F. Robert. *No Child Left Behind: A Study of Its Impact on Art Education*, National Art Education Association, 2010. <https://www.arteducators.org/research/articles/107-no-child-left-behind>.
- Seaboldt, Betty Oliver. "Defining Art Appreciation." *Art Education* (Reston, VA.) 54, no. 4 (2001): 44-49.
- Stearns, Samantha. "'What Changed' in Social Studies Education: A View from the Classroom." *Perspectives on History*. Summer 2019, published July 30, 2019. <https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/summer-2019/what-changed-in-social-studies-education>.
- Tal, T., & Morag, O. "Reflective Practice as a Means for Preparing to Teach Outdoors in an Ecological Garden." *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 20, no. 3 (2009), 245-262.
- Taylor, Julie Anne, Timothy Monck, and Sanaa Ayoub. "Arts Integration in the Social Studies: Research and Perspectives from the Field." *The Councilor* 75, vol. 1 (2014): 23-48.
- U.S. Department of Education, Office of the Deputy Secretary. *No Child Left Behind: A Toolkit for Teachers*, Washington, D.C., 2004.
- Wan, Yinmei, Meredith Ludwig, Andrea Boyle, and Jim Lindsay. "The Role of Arts Integration and Education in Improving Student Outcomes." *Fostering Arts Rich Schools* 20, no. 1 (2020): 36-41.

Winsand, O.M. "Art Appreciation in the public schools from 1930 to 1960. Dissertation
Abstracts International. 22, no. 6 (1961).